



**CORAL TRIANGLE  
INITIATIVE**  
ON CORAL REEFS, FISHERIES AND FOOD SECURITY

**CORAL TRIANGLE INITIATIVE  
ON CORAL REEFS, FISHERIES AND FOOD SECURITY (CTI-CFF)  
Regional Ecosystem Approach To Fisheries Management (EAFM)  
Technical Working Group (TWG)**

**MINUTES OF MEETING**

Fourth CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting  
November 24-25, 2013  
Edsa Shangri-la Manila, Philippines

**BACKGROUND**

The 4th meeting of the Regional EAFM Technical Working Group provided the opportunity to follow up on actions arising from the 12-14 May 2013 meeting of the EAFM Working Group including the EAFM indicators and Country 10 Year Roadmaps; and to consider the outcomes of the 2nd CTI-CFF Regional Priorities Workshop held in Manado in August 2013. With the US Coral Triangle Initiative Support Program (USCTI) project ending in a few months, there is also a need for the EAFM TWG to deal with a number of issues including transitioning after USCTI. This meeting also facilitated the handover of the Chair of the EAFM Working Group to Indonesia and co-Chair to Solomon Islands.

The overall objectives of this 4<sup>th</sup> EAFM TWG meeting included the following:

- Handover of EAFM Chair to Indonesia and Co-Chair to Solomon Islands
- To address the outcomes of the 2nd CTI-CFF Regional Priorities Workshop related to the Regional Plan of Action (RPOA) Goal 2 [Ecosystem Approach to Management of Fisheries (EAFM) and other Marine Resources Fully Applied]; Prioritize Actions.
- Progress Report on EAFM Indicators
- Progress Report on CT Country 10 Year Plans
- Progress Report on LRFFT Inter-Governmental Forum
- Discussion on the transition process and handover of US Coral Triangle Initiative Support Program (USCTI) EAFM regional products to the CT6 and future plans and support for CTI EAFM activities
- Progress report on Solomon Islands roll out of the Mobile fisheries app and potential for replication in other CT6 countries

The 4<sup>th</sup> CTI-CFF Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management Technical Working Group (EAFM TWG) Meeting was held at the Edsa Shangri-La Hotel in Manila, Philippines on November 24<sup>th</sup>-25<sup>th</sup> 2013. The meeting was attended by delegates from Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Solomon Islands and Timor Leste, as well as support partners from US CTI Support Program team and observers as per participants' list in Annex I. Papua New Guinea (PNG) was not able to attend the meeting.

## **DAY ONE**

### **OPENING CEREMONIES**

1. The meeting officially opened with the ceremonial turnover of the EAFM Technical Working Group chairmanship from Malaysia to Indonesia. Ms. Tan Geik Hong, the head of the Marine Resources Management Section of the Department of Fisheries in Malaysia officially hand over the chairmanship to Dr Toni Ruchimat, the director for Fisheries Resources of the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries in Indonesia.
2. Dr. Ruchimat accepted the chairmanship of the EAFM Technical Working Group and summoned the support and participation of the CT6 countries to move forward the agenda of the EAFM TWG in the next three years. He hoped that Indonesia will be able to continue the achievements of the EAFM TWG under the former leadership of Malaysia.
3. Mr. Arwandrija Rukma from the CTI-CFF Interim Regional Secretariat thanked the participants for being able to attend the meeting; the Philippines for hosting the meeting; and the partners for providing technical and logistic support in organizing the meeting. He recalled that there were two occasions that led to this meeting, the first of which was the 3rd EAFM Technical Working Group Meeting in Bali, Indonesia wherein Philippines offered to host this meeting today. The second is the 2nd CTI Regional Priority Workshop in Manado on August 2013 where priority actions were identified that will be presented to SOM on Tuesday. Knowing the complexities of EAFM as it contributes to the overall objective of CTI on food security, the EAFM TWG was able to showcase a model for good communication and coordination among the CT6.
4. Ms. Jessica Muñoz of the Bureau of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources of the Philippines welcomed everyone, the delegates from the CT6 and the partners in Manila. She hoped that the group will be able to have a productive discussion on the next day so that decisions may be made for presentation in SOM.
5. Each of the participants, starting off with the delegates, followed by the partners introduced themselves.
6. Ms. Erni Widjajanti from the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Directorate General of Capture Fisheries headed the Indonesian delegates and thanked the Philippines for hosting the meeting. She reported that Indonesia has developed indicators for EAFM which they will share tomorrow.
7. Ms. Hong of Malaysia congratulated Indonesia as the Chair of the EAFM TWG and Solomon Islands as the Co-Chair. She assured the group that Malaysia will continue to cooperate to move the EAFM agenda forward. She also offered their sympathy to the Philippines for the recent catastrophe and said that they will give support. She also thanked Philippines for hosting and for the CTI partners for supporting the meeting.
8. Mr. Henrique Simao Barreto of the National Directorate Fishery and Aquaculture in Timor Leste said they would like to work with the other counties in CT6 while they implement the EAFM.
9. Ms. Ronnelle Panda, the Deputy Director-Policy, Planning, and Project Management of the Ministry of Fisheries and Marine Resources of the Solomon Islands Government thanked the Philippines for hosting the meeting. She stressed that EAFM is a very important aspect that can be implemented in their country so she looks forward to discussions tomorrow.

### **Agenda Item I: Organization of the Meeting**

#### **Election of Officers**

10. Malaysia nominated Indonesia to be the chair of the meeting and Indonesia nominated Philippines as the co-chair of the 4th Technical Working Group Meeting. There were no objections on the nominations so the meeting chair is Indonesia and the co-chair is the Philippines.

## Meeting Documents

11. The documents distributed in the envelopes of the delegates include the following:
  - a. 4-page agenda
  - b. Minutes of the Third CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting, May 14-16, 2013, Mercure Hotel, Sanur, Bali, Indonesia
  - a. EAFM indicators (a powerpoint presentation)
  - b. Summary of the Discussion on "Opportunities for Dialogue on Sustaining the Live Reef Food Fish Trade"
  - c. A Resolution on Sustainable Live Reef Food Fish Trade for the Southeast Asian and CTI-CFF Member Countries
  - d. Regional Priorities Workshop for the Fourth EAFM TWG Meeting
  - e. A Regional Framework for Legislation and Policy to Support and Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries Management (EAFM) in the Coral Triangle Initiative (CTI)
  - f. 2nd Regional Priority Workshop (Output Report)
  - g. NOAA IUU Fishing Team
  - h. COAST FISH (a powerpoint presentation)

## Organization of Work

12. The meeting agenda (Annex 2) was presented and accepted by the group including the following changes:
  - a. Session 7. Transition of US CTSP to be transferred to Session 9.
  - b. Session 8. Replication of the Solomon Islands CTI-CFF Mobile Platform for inshore fisheries data collection to become Session 7
  - c. Session 9. ADB RETA Update to become Session 8.
  - d. Add Session 10. Wrap Up and Next Steps

## Adoption of the meeting agenda

13. The agenda was accepted as amended.

## Photo Session

14. The first day ended with a photo session with all the delegates and with all the participants/observers.

## DAY TWO

### Agenda Item 2: Minutes of Previous Meeting

15. The Minutes of the Third EAFM TWG Meeting held in Bali, Indonesia on May 14-16, 2013 was reviewed and approved without amendments (Annex 3).
16. The Meeting noted that issues and action points arising from the 3<sup>rd</sup> CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting are considered in the 4<sup>th</sup> CTI-CFF EAFM TWG Meeting Agenda.

### Agenda Item 3: CT6 Country Reports and 10-year CT6 country roadmaps to implement the EAFM regional framework

#### Indonesia

17. Ms. Widjajanti gave the country report for Indonesia (Annex 4). Accomplishments based on the EAFM Roadmap 2010-2014 were enumerated. She emphasized the initiative of the country in developing EAFM indicators as part of Target 1 of Goal 2 of their National Plan of Action which is Strong Legislative, Policy and Regulatory Framework in Place for Achieving an EAFM. She also mentioned that the country has already initiated collaborative patrols and surveillance on IUU Fishing.

## **Comments**

18. Mr. James T. Berdach of ADB RETA informed the group their team is undertaking a harmonization process using the seascape approach. A position paper is being prepared based on preliminary research, after which several consultations will be conducted from which recommendations will be developed which might feed in to the strengthening of the EAFM.
19. Mr. Maurice Knight of US CTI also informed the TWG that there has been similar discussion with the Australian government. A small group meeting shall be convened between the ADB RETA team and the Australian Government to be facilitated by the US CTI team to discuss how the two similar programs could complement each other considering that they both look not only on country level initiatives but also at the seascape level.
20. Dr. Ruchimat also informed the TWG that the COREMAP CTI project will soon be implemented in Indonesia which will demonstrate the EAFM approach starting in the western FMA and followed by the eastern FMA

## **Malaysia**

21. Ms. Hong presented the accomplishment report of the Malaysia (Annex 5). She said that they have conducted several workshops leading towards the strengthening of the EAFM implementation

## **Comments**

22. Mr. Knight inquired on how the species management was undertaken in Sabah. Mr. Godfery Kissey said that the demonstration site in Samporna for the two species is a GEF-funded project under Dr. Norasma Dacho. This is a project of the fisheries sub-committee of the SSME which provides a venue for strong involvement and participation of the fishers who signed an MOU with the Fisheries Department to implement the rules and regulations on fisheries management.

## **Timor Leste**

23. Mr. Antonio De Jesus, senior staff of the National Directorate Fishery and Aquaculture in Timor Leste presented the accomplishment report for Timor Leste (Annex 6). The list of activities was provided starting from 2010 with the rapid assessment of the fisheries dependent communities at the national level. The ongoing activities in the country include the zonation of the coastal waters in several sites assisted by the Conservation International.

## **Solomon Islands**

24. Mr. Ben Buga, the Chief Fisheries Officer presented the Solomon Islands country report (Annex 7). Several EAFM trainings were conducted in the country sponsored and organized by various partners including CTSP-CI and the Australian Government.

## **Philippines**

25. Dr. Noel Barut of BFAR presented the EAFM Progress in the Philippines. (Annex 8). He reported several policies and regulations recently signed for implementation as well as several projects being implemented by the Bureau of Fisheries in support to EAFM in the country.

## **Comments**

26. Ms. Annadel Cabanban of ADB RETA inquired about the GEF 5 project. Dr. Barut will implement the EAFM framework in the 5 municipalities of southern Palawan

27. Dr. Pomeroy asked what has been done on the formulation of EAFM operation mechanism with the Philippines Fisheries Code. Ms. Sandy Arcamo said that they are incorporating EAFM with the ICM concepts in the Philippines although the focus of the EAFM is basically fisheries.

#### **Agenda Item 4: EAFM indicators**

28. Dr. Pomeroy presented the EAFM indicators as part of the development of monitoring and evaluation system of the CTI RPOA. These indicators are inputs to the State of the Coral Triangle Report (SCTR). He presented the framework for the indicators from output level to impact level. Each of the CTI themes has a set of indicators and one of which is the EAFM. (Annex 9)
29. Indonesia presented the EAFM indicators that have been developed in their country. (Annex 10)
30. The Monitoring and Evaluation Working Group (M&EWG) listed actions needed from the EAFM TWG on the finalization of the EAFM Regional indicators. These actions include some clarifications on and confirmation on some of the indicators. Some actions were already done during the Third EAFM TWG meeting in Bali, Indonesia which includes the deletion of indicators 2.2.3 and 2.2.4 and retain the rest of the indicators.
31. Ms. Luz Baskinas, member of the M&EWG provided an update on the CTI-CFF M&E. She mentioned that the M&EWG presented the M&E system for CTI-CFF in SOM 8 that subsequently adopted the system. SOM 8 further tasked the M&EWG to come up with the M&E operational manual. The M&EWG will present the manual in SOM9 and part of the presentation is a recommendation on the capability building program of the CT6 countries that signified a low capability in establishing baselines, conducting assessments to report on the agreed indicators.
32. On items 2.3.3, 2.4.3 and 2.4.4, Indonesia clarified if there is a need to establish new standard or adopt the existing related standards. Ms. Baskinas said the EAFM TWG will decide on these clarifications but she prefers that existing standards should be used. Ms. Cabanban informed the delegates that there has already been an assessment on grouper and three of the species of grouper found in the CTI are assessed as vulnerable based on 2007 information. However, there is a need to update the status of this information from the CTI countries. The chairman agreed that IUCN has released a new list of vulnerable, rare, endangered and threatened species which can be used for the planning and management of the CT6.
33. On item 2.4.2, Philippines clarified that this item has the same indicator under MPA theme. Ms. Baskinas clarified that the MPA indicator is actually referring to the CTMPAs.
34. On item 2.1.1, Malaysia clarified that since EAFM is a tool for fisheries management, would the indicator also consider existing policies of the countries that are referred to as fisheries resources management and not necessarily and specifically termed EAFM
35. The clarification from Solomon Islands is whether baselines of these indicators have already been established. Ms. Baskinas said that the indicators were developed with each of the countries in CT6 and they have agreed to adopt the indicators. Although there are countries that need assistance to enhance their capacity in establishing the baselines or conducting assessments necessary and needed to measure the indicators identified.
36. The delegates from the five (5) countries agreed to provide feedback on the indicators on or before the last week of January 2014.

**Agenda Item 5: CTI live reef food fish multi-stakeholders forum and the report on the live reef food fish (LRFFT) Intergovernmental forum**

37. Mr. Knight presented the updates on the live reef food fish trade in the CT6 (Annex 11). The action points were discussed.
38. The process of designating SEAFDEC as the Interim Secretariat to host the regional forum to promote information exchange, collaboration and continuous dialogue among stakeholders on Live Reef Food Fish for CTI shall commence after the admission of SEAFDEC as a member of the CTI partner group by SOM. This will be tackled in Session 9 of the second day of SOM 9. This process was agreed upon by the EAFM TWG because the initial plan to forge a MOU between SEAFDEC and CTI CFF IRS will not be undertaken considering that the IRS is still an interim body and will not have a juridical personality to enter into MOU. It is noted that the SEAFDEC is the most effective secretariat for LRFFT considering that it represents a convergence of ASEAN and CTI.
39. On the demand side of LRFFT, a meeting was organized in Hong Kong but there was hesitance from the government on possibilities of initiating policies and regulations relating to the demand on LRFFT. The other actions undertaken by the CT6 countries include inviting the Hong Kong government as observers on several meetings and workshops of the TWG and writing letters to the Hong Kong authorities on possible cooperation efforts on sustainability of LRFFT. Two potential approaches can be under taken under this matter which includes and diplomatic approach which entails collaboration between the embassies of the countries of the CT6 and Hong Kong and technical approach which entail collaboration initiatives with the technical departments of the CT6 countries and Hong Kong and China.
40. Some suggestions from the partners include: 1) initiating collaborations with other countries such as Singapore and Malaysia for the market of LRFFT and hope to radiate the initiatives in several countries until the high end market such as Hong Kong and China can be reached; 2) regulations from the source such as on conducting of non-detrimental studies on the LRFF to determine quota on volume and size limits of specific species to be exported, improvement on practices such as elimination of the use of sodium cyanide, sustainable aquaculture practices and setting up market standards using ecolabeling mechanisms and MSC standards.

**Agenda Item 6: Regional Priorities Workshop Outcomes 2014-2016**

41. Dr. Pomeroy presented the EAFM priority actions that were identified during the August 20-22, 2013 workshop in Manado. Of the seven regional priority actions, two were the highest rated priority actions namely, Goal 2, Target 1, Regional Action 2: Improved enforcement of IUU fishing through greater collaboration and Goal 2, Target 4, Regional Action 2: Establish an informal CTI Forum on management of and international trade in coral reef based organisms (Annex 12).
42. Philippines inquired on the process that was used to come up with the priority actions as some other actions may be more important than the two mentioned above. This query will be responded by looking at the details of each of the priority actions identified.
43. For the first priority, implementation of the EAFM Regional Framework in each country, the actions were presented and there were no comments from the 5 countries present in the meeting (Annex 13)
44. The improvement of enforcement of IUU fishing through greater collaboration was explained further with the NOAA IUU Fishing Team report. The key point numbers 35 and 41 were not acted upon by the EAFM TWG considering that the RPOA-IUU does not have a relevant link with the IUU on LRFT because RPOA IUU is mainly focused on large vessels and industrial fisheries. However, should the CTI CFF IUU be implemented under the RPOA IUU, the activities would only include awareness raising and participation in the intergovernmental forum (Annex 14).

45. Mr. Rene Acosta of USAID provided a background on the collaboration between RPOA IUU and CTI- CFF IUU which started when the CTI Regional Secretariat was invited by RPOA IUU in the Singapore meeting. In November 2011, the two agreed to cross link their websites. There was no formal link between the two but there are initial coordination initiatives such as the LRFFT workshop in Bangkok and several transboundary actions of the SSME subcommittee particularly on MCS. Because both secretariats remain on an interim status, the formal and legislated coordination remains a challenge. However, it is worthy to note that the actions needed from each country falls on the same government entity which is the department/ministry of fisheries.
46. Solomon Islands declared that the country has decided to become active member of the RPOA IUU and not just observers.
47. SEAFDEC provides the overlap between the CTI countries and the ASEAN countries. The advantage of the overlap is that SEAFDEC will be reaching to the CT countries which are also SEAFDEC member countries. CT IRS on the other hand will also reach out to the other CT countries that were non member of SEAFDEC while SEAFDEC reaching out to their member countries which are non-CT countries.
48. Philippines reported that there are existing MCS protocols not only for the LRFF but for other species in the three countries of SSME, which is a priority seascape for CTI.
49. On the request of the three countries (Solomon Islands, Papua New Guinea and Timor-Leste) for assistance in developing a communications plan addressing scaling between community and local levels through national and federal governments and communicating between countries at each of those levels and to develop a program of targeted enforcement capacity building, Malaysia has no objection but also requested to include the other CT countries in the capacity building activities. Philippines has no objection so the request is subsequently endorsed by the TWG
50. Dr. Pomeroy presented a brief orientation on COASTFISH. Mr. Knight agreed to email to the chair the new livelihood publication produced under the project (Annex 15)
51. Indonesia requested a 2-minute presentation on the National Data Sharing System to facilitate prevention of IUU based on their policy (Annex 16).
52. Indonesia presented the priority actions on sustainable exploitation of shared tuna stocks. Indonesia informed the TWG that the country will host an informal CTI forum on Tuna Governance in 2014. The country has allocated funds for this activity (Annex 17).
53. Tuna fisheries should be further studied so that appropriate management actions will be undertaken.
54. Solomon Islands shared the PNA model, which is a subregional agreement which involves at least 8 countries. Several initiatives have been by the PNA including VMS.
55. The Philippines supports the proposal of Indonesia on coming up with a management plan for tuna fisheries in the CTI.
56. A joint meeting on tuna will be held in Bali, Indonesia on November or December and the CTI countries and partners will be invited to attend the said meeting.
57. On the priority actions on LRFFT, a concept paper should be developed and presented to the TWG specifying the terms of reference of the regional forum on LRFFT. Should the difficulty in formalizing the forum, an informal information sharing can be initiated among the CT6 countries while anticipating a permanent or formal structure for the forum. WWF will help in developing the concept paper

58. Philippines suggested looking into the possibility of having the EAFM TWG as a venue for regional governance on LRFFT if creating another RFMO for LRFFT would become a challenge.

#### **Agenda Item 7: Replication of the Solomon Islands CTI-CFF Mobile Platform for inshore fisheries data collection**

59. A group presentation by participants from the Solomon Islands on the CTSP-funded Mobile Platform for inshore fisheries data collection. The model developed a mobile application that can be installed in the mobile phones of enumerators and survey participants. The data quality assurance was also installed in the model in order to prevent irrelevant data inputs in the system. A real time data analysis can be provided by the system to understand the current state of fisheries and be able to do a management scheme to respond to the information generated (Annex 18).
60. The initiative can be further developed and utilized by the country in the next project that they will implement through new funding from New Zealand.

#### **Agenda Item 8: ADB RETA Update**

61. The update on the ADB CTI RETA was provided by Ms. Cabanban showing the contribution of the project in the implementation of the EAFM in the CTI countries. Some scientific studies were conducted as bases of management actions for groupers under the LRFFT priority action. Capacity building and planning workshops will also be conducted under the project including provision of sustainable livelihood options under the poverty reduction component under COASTFISH (Annex 19).

#### **Agenda Item 9: Transition of US CTSP**

62. Mr. Knight informed the EAFM TWG that the US CTSP will be ending by December 2013. He thanked the delegates and the partners for the strong partnerships developed through the CTSP project. He hopes to continue to work with the group in his next project.
63. The chairman also thanked Mr. Knight and the US CTSP team for helping the TWG in strengthening and providing technical and logistical support.

#### **Agenda Item 10: Wrap Up and Next Steps**

64. Dr. Pomeroy presented to the group the action statements of the EAFM TWG to be presented in the SOM (Annex 20). The comments and discussions of the delegates include the following:
- a. Solomon Islands wanted to add "inshore fisheries data collection" in item number 5
  - b. While Indonesia disagrees to include item number 5 because it may not be possible in bigger countries like Indonesia; Malaysia also express the same opinion because there is an existing similar model in their country; Philippines supported the inclusion of item number 5 considering its last phrase, "as appropriate". The two countries agreed with the Philippines
  - c. Indonesia suggested adding the priority actions on tuna management as item number 6. Malaysia and Philippines disagreed because it is already captured in item number 3 which is endorsing the implementation of the priority actions. Indonesia reiterated that inclusion of tuna management as item number 6 will give emphasis on the tuna management in the next five years of CTI RPOA implementation. The delegates agreed to add in item number 3, the following: "noting in particular the importance of strengthening regional governance of tuna fisheries through formation of an informal tuna fisheries forum"
  - d. Indonesia has allocated funds for the conduct and hosting of the tuna forum in 2014 as an initial intervention of CTI EAFM TWG on tuna management. The succeeding forum in the next years may be conducted back to back with the TWG on EAFM.
  - e. Malaysia expressed apprehensions on item number 2 since SOM 9 will tackle as part of its agenda, the admission of SEAFDEC as CTI partner. Also, the statement implies that the NCCC has already



- formally endorsed SEAFDEC as the secretariat for LRFFT. The delegates agree to add the phrase "...the parties agree in principle ..." to indicate that it is not yet formally endorsed by the NCCCs.
- f. Solomon Islands inquired if they could include the agreement on the finalization of the EAFM indicators. The rest of the delegates disagrees as this is an action point for the TWG that does not require action from SOM
65. With the abovementioned revisions on the Decision Document of the EAFM TWG, the delegates agree to present to the SOM 9 on November 26, 2013

## **CLOSING CEREMONIES**

66. Mr. Ruchimat delivered a closing statement reiterating his deep gratitude to Philippines, the host country for excellently hosting the meeting, the US CTI Support Program for its continued support and the CT6 country representatives for their active participation and productive contribution during the meeting. Mr. Ruchimat summarized the key action items that need attention and follow up actions by the countries and the EAFM TWG Secretariat as follows:
- a. All countries shall provide feedback to the chairman on the EAMF indicators before the end of January 2014
  - b. The demand-base approach on sustainable LRFFT is still a challenge, however the EAFM TWG hopes to have a clearer direction after the admission of SEAFDEC as CTI partner in SOM 9
  - c. Tuna management in the CTI is an opportunity for the CT6 to sustain the EAFM Framework implementation with support from the CTI partners and stakeholders
  - d. The recently developed technology in Solomon Islands on conducting electronic surveys in small scale fisheries can be adopted in the CT6 countries as deemed appropriate.

The Meeting adjourned at 18:50, 25<sup>th</sup> of November 2013.