

# 4TH CTI-CFF REGIONAL BUSINESS FORUM Nusa Dua, Bali, Indonesia, 27-29 August 2015































The 'Coral Triangle Sustainable Marine Tourism Conference' was the Fourth Regional Business Forum (RBF) under the Coral Triangle Initiative on Coral Reefs, Fisheries and Food Security (CTI-CFF).

Hosted by the Indonesia Coordinating Ministry for Maritime Affairs, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, and the Ministry of Tourism, Indonesia.

Co-organized by the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, US Agency for International Development, the US Department of the Interior, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration and the Coral Triangle Center.

Supported by the World Wildlife Fund, The Nature Conservancy, Conservation International, Tone, XL Axiata, and Bank Negara Indonesia.































Cover photo courtesy of Cipto Gunawan

Report photos courtesy of: BW Gallery, Sakib Arsalan, Edwin S. Bimo, Bali Tourism Board & Dharmawan Sutanto

Report information collated and produced with support from:



## **Executive Summary**

This fourth CTI-CFF Regional Business Forum focused on the issues surrounding sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle (CT), with particular focus on: (i) identifying and promoting best practices for responsible marine and coastal tourism; (ii) identifying and promoting the enabling conditions required to support private sector leadership and engagement in sustainable and responsible marine and coastal tourism in the Coral Triangle, and (iii) exploring the branding and marketing of the Coral Triangle as a global sustainable tourism destination.

The event was attended by 361 participants from the marine tourism private sector, government representatives from the six CT nations, NGOs, universities and associated institutions. Participants attended all or some of the various activities in the forum, which included: the Coral Triangle Sustainable Marine Tourism Conference, with guest speakers from both the CT region and around the world, this conference included ten topic based sessions and three panel discussions open to all participants; the Coral Triangle Marine Tourism Investment Forum & Buyer-Sellers Market, providing an arena for prospective tourism investors to meet with government representatives and other business representatives to forge sustainable investment cooperation in the Coral Triangle's marine conservation areas; the Coral Triangle Marine Tourism Expo, showcasing marine and eco-tourism businesses in the Coral Triangle region; three high level Roundtable discussions focused on the three forum themes; the Womens Leaders Forum Roundtable; CTI-CFF Local Government Network (LGN) 1st Executive Committee Meeting; a field trip to Nusa Penida MPA and Learning site; a Learning Cocktail Event, and a Gala Dinner.

Of the total number of participants, 110 were from the marine tourism private sector, 75 were from NGOs or associated academic and support institutions, and 156 were government representatives, with an additional 20 representatives from the media.

A wide range of recommendations and next steps emerged from the forum. The recommendations related to policy makers and regulatory decision makers will be compiled and presented at the upcoming CTI-CFF senior officials meeting (SOM) meeting in November, with associated information to support the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat to formalize these into clear policy related promotion for all CT6 countries. Pertinent recommendations the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat anticipate to take to the SOM for approval and follow up are:

- 1. To coordinate and officiate the development of guidelines for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.
- 2. To promote existing, and / or new (where relevant) sustainable marine tourism certification programs in line with the aforementioned guidelines.
- 3. To engage in, and support, the branding and marketing of key destinations in the Coral Triangle, with the recognition that destination branding may not adhere to administrative boundaries or limitations, and support the necessary coordination across administrative boundaries to facilitate effective destination marketing.
- 4. To ensure appropriate regulatory and investment related provision of incentives, and identify and remove any associated regulatory or investment related disincentives, to promote sustainable marine tourism investment in the Coral Triangle.
- 5. To enable the development of clear investment and development processes for sustainable tourism in and adjacent to marine protected areas.
- 6. To further explore and promote the development of financing mechanisms in collaboration with private sector partners, to support the achievement of the goals of the CTI-CFF. Mechanisms to explore include: the establishment of a regional challenge fund; the development of special eco-economic zones; the development of impact investment models; the establishment of collaborative user-fee systems in MPAs; the promotion of direct engagement businesses where private operators directly contribute to marine and coastal management support.

- 7. To establish clear and transparent systems to ensure financing and management mechanisms uphold to the highest levels of integrity, accountability and good governance.
- 8. To ensure there is consistency and coordination between all relevant governmental agencies and institutions in promoting sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

In addition to these recommendations targeted towards policy makers and regulatory decision makers in the Coral Triangle, a number of important recommendations emerged for private sector operators and community representatives across the region. These recommendations will be shared with all relevant private sector and associated community groups across the CT region (i.e. through tourism associations in all six nations, investment groups and key influencers in the private sector, and community based networks) for wide dissemination amongst stakeholders. The recommendations are:

- 1. To engage in the development and implementation of sustainable tourism guidelines for the Coral Triangle.
- 2. To engage in certification programs where possible / relevant, and ensure operational standards meet the level required to achieve relevant sustainable tourism certification of investments and operations.
- 3. To support the development of a clear business case that can be used in communications and promotions for other investors and operators to proactively embrace sustainability principles.
- 4. To ensure the involvement of local communities (if private sector) and / or engage proactively in investment activities (if communities) in tourism operations.
- 5. To engage and be involved in the upcoming efforts to develop effective branding and marketing for key marine destinations in the Coral Triangle.
- 6. To promote and ensure there is effective coordination between private sector associations involved in sustainability issues.
- 7. To lead by example, and ensure all operations follow best practice principles for sustainable tourism.

Finally, a number of recommendations emerged that were relevant to technical support institutions (NGOs, universities etc) across the region. These recommendations will be disseminated widely to all technical support and associated institutions in the Coral Triangle, and were:

- 1. To provide technical support to the development of guidelines for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.
- 2. To provide research and technical support for the promotion of existing, and / or new sustainable marine tourism certification initiative(s) to promote sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.
- 3. To provide capacity building support to relevant private sector actors, community groups and governmental agencies to promote a strong understanding of all elements related to sustainable marine tourism design, development, implementation and management (in accordance with associated guidelines developed).
- 4. To provide technical support to the development of a branding and marketing initiative for key destinations in the Coral Triangle.
- 5. To provide research and collaborative technical support to the development of a clear business case that can be used in communications and promotions for investors and operators to proactively embrace sustainability principles.
- 6. To provide technical support to governmental agencies and associated private sector actors and communities in identifying future potential business opportunities for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.
- 7. To promote the advancement of 'voluntourism' engagement across the region, to support sustainable marine tourism related operations, sites and visitor experiences.
- 8. To undertake associated research activities where desired / required to support sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

(Full information on recommendations is provided in the section on Conclusion and Next Steps)

## **Contents**

Executive Summary	2
Introduction	5
The Forum	6
Keynote Speakers and Associated Dignitaries	7
Opening Ceremony and Opening Remarks	8
Results of the Roundtables	g
Roundtable 1: Sustainable Tourism	g
Roundtable 2: Branding and Marketing	10
Roundtable 3: Financing Strategies	11
Panel Sessions	12
Panel Session 1: Enabling Conditions for Private Sector Leadership	12
Panel Session 2: Best Practices for Responsible Tourism	14
Panel Session 3: Branding and Marketing the Coral Triangle	15
Open Sessions	17
Session 1: Branding and Marketing the Coral Triangle	17
Session 2: Eco-certification	18
Session 3: Cruise Impacts and Innovations	19
Session 4: Dive Tourism Impacts and Innovations	20
Session 5: Corporate Social Responsibility	21
Session 6: Linking Sustainable Tourism to Local Industries and Communities	23
Session 7: Symbiotic relationships: coastal tourism, MPAs and fisheries	24
Session 8: Training and Support for Local Communities and Cultural Tourism	25
Session 9: Supporting Conservation Financing Through Sustainable Tourism	26
Session 10: Traveler's Philanthropy and Volun-tourism	27
Side Events	28
The CTI-CFF Local Government Network 1st Executive Committee Meeting	28
CTI-CFF Women Leaders Forum	29
Business Advisory Council Meeting	31
The EXPO	32
Investment Forum	33
The Buyer-Sellers Meetings on Coral Triangle Dive Tourism	33
Special Events	34
Signing of MOU: CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat and Coral Triangle Center	34
Gala Dinner	35
Visit to Kima Gardens	39
Visit to Nusa Penida MPA	40
Learning Cocktail Reception	41
Feedback and Assessment	43
Media Coverage	43
Conclusions and Next Steps	44

#### Introduction

The Coral Triangle (CT) region covers all or part of the exclusive economic zones of six countries: Indonesia, Malaysia, Papua New Guinea, Philippines, Solomon Islands and Timor-Leste. While the region only covers 1.6% of the planet's oceanic area, the CT represents the global epicenter of marine abundance and diversity, including: > 75% of the worlds' coral species; > 3,000 coral fish species; the greatest extent of mangrove forests in the world, and spawning areas for the largest tuna fishery in the world. The area is also frequented by a host of charismatic megafauna, including turtles, whales (including the blue whale), dolphins, porpoises, and the endangered dugong.

The marine and coastal resources within the Coral Triangle provide profound benefits to >350 million people who reside within region, and many millions beyond. One-third of the inhabitants within the CT live in coastal communities and depend directly on local marine and coastal resources for their income, livelihoods, and food security. The tuna spawning and nursery grounds support a multi-billion dollar (US) tuna industry enjoyed by tens of millions of consumers worldwide, providing thousands of jobs for inhabitants within the region. Healthy reef systems and mangrove belts also protect coastal communities from increasingly intense storms in the region.

However, the regions marine and coastal environments face considerable threats. Over 80% of the coral reefs are considered to be 'at risk' from coastal development and fishing-related pressures, and many important fisheries across the region are depleted, with some fisheries already collapsed or heading toward collapse.

To address these concerns, the Coral Triangle Initiative on Coral Reefs, Fisheries and Food Security (CTI-CFF) was launched in 2009 as a multilateral partnership of the six Coral Triangle countries. Through this initiative, the CT countries agreed to support biodiversity conservation through the protection of species, habitats and ecosystems, to promote sustainable development, poverty reduction and food security for coastal communities.

From the beginning of the initiative the importance of engaging businesses and the private sector has been recognized as critical to achieving the various goals of the CTI-CFF. To facilitate this private sector engagement, three Regional Business Forums (RBFs) were held from 2010 to 2013, engaging a broad spectrum of business representatives from across the region, resulting in a wide range of successful partnerships and collaborations. At the third RBF it was determined that future RBFs be more business sector specific, with the tourism sector identified as a priority for engagement.

Tourism was selected as the business sector of focus because as it is a rapidly expanding industry in the region, with more than 39 million international tourists visiting the coral triangle countries in 2013. The beauty and richness of the marine and coastal environment in the coral triangle is a significant factor for many of these tourists choosing to visit this region. Tourism is an important component of the CT countries' economy as well as a significant source of its foreign exchange revenues, generating an estimated 12 billion USD annually, and ranking as one of the top 4 goods and services export sectors in each CT nation. Tourism provides between 0.7% (lowest) and 5.7% (highest) of the CT nations individual GDPs (Papua New Guinea and Malaysia respectively) and is estimated to provide employment to ~ 16 million people across the region (though this figure is likely under-estimated).

Tourism brings with it both impacts and opportunities. Unsustainably managed tourism can have detrimental effects on the marine and coastal environment and can threaten to degrade the very resource that people are drawn to visit. Land-based sources of marine pollution and coastal habitat conversion are primary threats identified by the CTI-CFF and are often associated with tourism development. Sewage, trash, and chemicals are all byproducts of tourism that can directly impact marine resources. However,

sustainably, well managed tourism enterprises can work to compliment the conservation of an area and cultural heritage of the region.

The decision to focus on tourism was supported by the CTI-CFF priority-setting meeting in September 2013 with the Interim Regional Secretariat, CT6 representatives, and other partners in Manado; and later endorsed by the CTI-CFF SOM 9 meeting in November 2013.

Thus the 'Coral Triangle Sustainable Marine Tourism Conference' was borne, as the fourth Regional Business Forum (RBF) under the CTI-CFF. This three-day forum was hosted by the Indonesia Coordinating Ministry for Maritime Affairs, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, and the Ministry of Tourism, and was co-organized by the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, US Agency for International Development, the US Department of the Interior, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration and the Coral Triangle Center, with support from the World Wildlife Fund, The Nature Conservancy, Conservation International, Tone, XL Axiata, and Bank Negara Indonesia.

### The Forum

This fourth CTI-CFF Regional Business Forum focused on the issues surrounding sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle, with particular focus on the below themes:

- Identifying and promoting best practices for responsible marine and coastal tourism.
- Identifying and promoting the enabling conditions required to support private sector leadership and engagement in sustainable and responsible marine and coastal tourism in the Coral Triangle.
- Exploring the branding and marketing of the Coral Triangle as a global sustainable tourism destination.

The forum was attended by 361 participants, from more than 20 countries. Of these attendee's 30% (n=110) were representatives from the marine tourism private sector, 21% (n=75) were NGO or associated institutional representatives, and 43% (n=156) were Government representatives from the six Coral Triangle nations, with the remaining 6% (n=20) attending from media institutions.

Of the speakers and moderators who participated, the largest sector represented was the private sector. 48% of speakers and moderators were from the private sector, with 30% from NGO or associated institutions, and 23% from Government agencies. The forum hosted a range of events, including:

- The Coral Triangle Sustainable Marine Tourism Conference with guest speakers from both the CT region and around the world, this conference included ten topic based sessions and three panel discussions open to all participants.
- The Coral Triangle Marine Tourism Investment Forum & Buyer-Sellers market this provided an arena for prospective tourism investors to meet with government representatives and other business representatives to forge sustainable investment cooperation in the Coral Triangle's marine conservation areas.
- The Coral Triangle Marine Tourism Expo the expo showcased marine and eco-tourism businesses in the Coral Triangle region.

Also open to all participants was the optional field trip to Nusa Penida MPA and learning cocktail reception being hosted off-site in Sanur. In addition to the above events, a wide number of closed door (invite only) sessions and side events were conducted during the forum, including: three high level roundtables focusing on policy outputs for the CTI-CFF related to the three themes of the forum; a women leaders forum roundtable aimed at engaging women entrepreneurs who have successfully catalyzed sustainable and environment-friendly businesses in the region; a CTI-CFF Local Government Network (LGN) 1st executive committee meeting and a gala dinner.

## **Keynote Speakers and Associated Dignitaries**

This fourth Regional Business Forum (RBF) created a great deal of interest and attracted a range of private sector tourism industry leaders and senior governmental representatives and associated dignitaries, including:

- HE Dato' Seri Mohammed Nazri bin Tan Sri Abdul Aziz, Minister of Tourism and Culture, Malaysia
- Hon. Bartholomew Parapolo Minister of Tourism and Culture, Solomon Island
- HE Prof. Dr. Ir. Indroyono Soesilo, Honorary Advisor for the Minister of Tourism, Republic of Indonesia
- HE Robert Blake, United States Ambassador to the Republic of Indonesia
- Dr. Asep D. Muhammad Secretary of Coordinating Ministry of Maritime Affairs
- Mr. Safri Burhanuddin Deputy of Human Resources, Science and Technology and Maritime Culture
- Dr. Sudirman Saad, Director General of Coastal, Marine and Small Islands, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries
- Mr. Eko Rudianto, Director of Coastal and Marine, MMAF
- Mr. Alfred Nakatsuma, Director, Regional Environment Office, USAID Regional Development Mission for Asia
- Mr. Francis Lee, President of Raffles Marina, Singapore
- Mr. Ismail Ning, Chairman of Pacto Ltd., Indonesia
- Mr. Franciscus Welirang, CEO of PT. Indofood Sukses Makmur Tbk
- Mr. Luigi Cabrini, Chairman of the Board of Directors of the Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC) and Advisor to the Secretary-General of the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO).
- Paul Holthus, Founding President and Chief Executive Officer of the World Ocean Council
- Mr. James Dion, Director of Tourism Programs, National Geographic Society



## **Opening Ceremony and Opening Remarks**

The opening ceremony launched the conference on the morning of August 27<sup>th</sup> 2015. The event included opening remarks from Dr. Widi Agoes Pratikto, Executive Director, Regional Secretariat CTI-CFF, who observed that the fast paced expansion of coastal and marine tourism has led to a range both environmental threats and opportunities, and highlighted the importance of the CTI-CFF in providing a platform to promote sustainable tourism across the region. He noted that a combined total of more than 500 people had participated in the three previous Regional Business Forums to date, but that this RBF was the largest and most targeted so far, "..reflecting the great interest of stakeholders to contribute to the collective pursuit of sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle." Mr. I Made Gujana, Head of Marine and Fisheries Agency Bali Province also provided an address on behalf of the Bali Governor Mr. I Made Mangku Pastika, welcoming all participants to Bali and recognizing the forum's importance and relevance to the host province.

Dr. Asep D. Muhammad, Secretary of Coordinating Ministry of Maritime Affairs, Indonesia, went on to remark on the importance of developing tourism enterprises in line with the principles of sustainability, to achieve the regions core aspiration to have balance between human development and the natural limits of our planet. In addition to these opening speeches Dr. Asep D. Muhammad opened the event by sounding a gong, and dance and music performances signified the start of the Forum.

Further addresses were given to start the afternoon of day one, where Mr. HE Dato' Seri Mohammed Nazri bin Tan Sri Abdul Aziz, Minister of Tourism and Culture, Malaysia remarked on the great opportunity the forum provides for exploring and expanding opportunities for sustainable tourism, hand in hand with the private sector. Hon. Mr. Bartholomew Parapolo Minister of Tourism and Culture, Solomon Island went on to comment that responsible tourism requires that operators, hoteliers, governments, local people and tourists take responsibility, and that marine conservation is everyone's business. Building on these remarks Captain Bobby R. Mamahit, from the Indonesian Ministry of Transportation observed that the Coral Triangle has the most attractive maritime destinations in the world; and in conjunction with sustainable tourism enterprises and operations, enhanced access and transportation throughout the archipelagic nations will be critical.

In the opening remarks on day two of the event, Honorary Advisor to the Minister of Tourism in Indonesia Dr. Indroyono Soesilo noted that developing marine tourism is high on the government's priorities and encouraged other CTI-CFF member countries, partners and international organizations, to support sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle. Mr. M. Eko Rudianto, Director of Marine and Coastal, Indonesia Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries also delivered a speech on behalf of Minister Susi Pudjiastuti, stating "Businesses in marine and coastal tourism in the Coral Triangle must receive adequate attention and commitment from all related stakeholders: governments, private sector, academia and communities. This can be in the form of support for infrastructure development, a roadmap for sustainable marine tourism, promotion and market access." U.S. Ambassador to Indonesia Robert Blake also providing opening remarks commending the efforts of the private sector that have led the way in sustainable marine tourism across the region, and underscored the importance of a long-term vision in promoting sustainable marine tourism practices.



### **Results of the Roundtables**

Three high level Roundtable Sessions were held on day one of the event, focusing on 'Tourism in MPAs'; 'Branding and marketing the Coral Triangle'; and 'Financing strategies in collaboration with the private sector'. The results of these roundtables are captured here and will provide input and guidance for the upcoming SOM meeting in November, with tangible recommendations developed for advancing public-private collaborations throughout the region.

#### **Roundtable 1: Sustainable Tourism**

This roundtable explored issues related to 'sustainable tourism practices in Marine Protected Areas: tourism infrastructure development and retrofit'. The roundtable involved 26 people from across the CT, Asia, Europe and the US, and from the private tourism sector, government agencies from the CT nations, NGOs and community representatives.

There was strong consensus that there should be Sustainable Tourism guidelines for investment in and around MPAs in the Coral Triangle. It was agreed however, that for these guidelines to be most productively meaningful, a range of challenges to establishing sustainable tourism enterprises would also need to be addressed. Through the discussions a range of challenges were identified and solutions proposed.

#### Some key *recommendations* were:

- Guidelines for sustainable tourism in the Coral Triangle could be largely built upon existing globally available guidelines, but with some tailored components specific to CT conditions. They should be relevant to all potential tourism related sectors, and accessible by all (i.e. available in a range of languages and in non-technical language).
- Information, capacity building and technical support needs to be available to deepen understanding of sustainable tourism practices across all sectors through the CT.
- Appropriate incentives need to be provided to the private sector and disincentives removed to encourage investment in sustainable tourism.
- There should be a 'one-stop-shop' within and adjacent to MPAs, where tourism developments can be engaged from the beginning, to promote appropriate investment in sustainable tourism, with full engagement and collaboration of the MPA authority and associated stakeholders.
- Participation in decision making processes must be very inclusive and respectful of local communities.
- A clear business case needs to be made, to help investors understand the positive opportunities that sustainable tourism approaches can provide. These cases can be developed by fellow private sector actors with technical support from partners and shared.
- There needs to be trust built between all sectors, along with clear communication.



## **Roundtable 2: Branding and Marketing**

This roundtable explored 'Branding and Marketing the Coral Triangle as a Global Sustainable Tourism Destination'. It involved 25 people from across the CT region, Asia, Europe and the US, and from the private tourism sector, government agencies from the CT nations, NGOs and community representatives.

There was *consensus* that there is great value in developing a nature-based tourism brand for the Coral Triangle, and that to do so it will be important to create an organizational structure for brand development. This may be another institution in addition to the CTI-CFF, to stimulate and champion the process, to reach consensus regarding integrated branding for all CT nations (incorporating local community level to international level representation).

#### It was *recognized* that:

- Clear definition of the values and vision underpinning the CT brand is required for brand development.
- It is not viable nor desirable to brand the entire Coral Triangle.
- A clear criteria for selecting sites for inclusion in branding and marketing efforts needs to be developed, that reflects the values of the CTI-CFF, as well as ensuring a quality visitor experience.
- Any branding and marketing efforts need to involve leaders of the private sector, as well as local businesses and local community representatives, to ensure a bottom-up process.
- Countries will be at different stages of sustainable tourism implementation, therefore ensuring capacity support to targeted areas will need to be part of a 'destination strategy' (see below) in order to effectively brand and market the area(s).

#### Some key *recommendations* were:

- To explore potential organizational structures for developing branding and marketing efforts through exploring similar efforts globally (Caribbean and ASEAN examples exist).
- To define the primary purpose of the brand, incorporating the championing of conservation.
- To agree on appropriate criteria for assessment of sites and inclusion in branding and marketing efforts (see results of Roundtable 1).
- To identify sites within the CT (utilizing agreed criteria) that reflect the values and vision of the CT initiative, focusing on identifying distinct outstanding areas for visitor experiences.
- To develop a destination positioning statement that speaks to the target market(s) in an emotionally connecting way, drawing upon the values of the CT Initiative.
- To develop a sustainable destination strategy for the CT (that addresses opportunities and constraints for destinations).
- To tie the brand into existing national tourism associations, and ensure strong partnerships between the business and government sectors for brand promotion.

Additionally the roundtable **recognized** that having an effective branding and marketing effort to drive more demand cannot be standalone – it must be connected with the promotion of livelihood needs, and long-term sustainable actions and community stewardship.



## **Roundtable 3: Financing Strategies**

This roundtable explored mechanisms for engaging private sector leadership and developing sustainable financial strategies to support the CTI-CFF goals. The roundtable involved 25 people from across the CT region, Asia, Europe and the US, and from the private tourism sector, Government agencies from the CT nations, NGOs and community representatives.

#### It was *recognized* that:

- The current funding gap for implementing the CTI-CFF is approximately \$1.9bn total (to 2020, ref: ADB assessment), and that meeting this gap will require a mix of funding sources from governments, private sector, philanthropists, NGOs etc.
- The private, public and NGO sectors speak in different languages, so some shared language needs to be found particularly in communicating with the private sector the benefits of investing in the natural resource base.
- All parties need to 'think big' and look for opportunities that are scalable, taking advantage of the fact that the CTI-CFF is a region-wide framework.
- A credible business case needs to be developed and articulated to promote private sector engagement, providing sound financial justification for supporting the CTI-CFF goals, whilst recognizing private sector benefits may vary between different sectors.
- Good governance and transparency is key to ensuring trust between different sectors. The private sector
  have an important role to play in influencing and ensuring accountability and continuity of commitments
  from Heads of State facing turnovers in government and associated staffing.
- Just as the CTI-CFF needs the private sector, so too does the private sector need the CTI-CFF particularly smaller operators, for credibility and multi-jurisdictional reach.

Potential *financing mechanisms* agreed by the group, that would help deepen the connection to the private sector in a tangible, concrete way were:

- The establishment of a regional challenge fund, akin to the 'Caribbean Challenge Initiative' (CCI) and 'Micronesia Challenge', to incentivize/match commitments from both government and private sector investors.
- The potential designation of well-planned 'special eco-economic zones' (SEEZs), to attract private sector funding to specific places and connect funding to the needs identified in CTI-CFF plans of action.
- Exploration of 'impact investment models', including examples where corporations' pool funding for low or zero interest loans for capital investments.

Other potential mechanisms identified included: non-voluntary mechanisms such as fees and regulations, and the establishment of a trust fund (if a mechanism for capitalizing on the regional economies of scale could effectively be balanced with a desire to raise funding for particular geographies/issues.) *Incentives* to support such mechanisms should include the establishment of a gold standards/certification scheme across the CT – this would utilize the CTI-CFF as mechanism to ensure a level playing field for competing businesses across the region.



#### **Panel Sessions**

Over the two days of the conference, three Panel Sessions were held exploring critical issues related to sustainable tourism, with invited industry leaders and experts in their field sharing their experiences and insights. Such discussions provided a deeper understanding and appreciation of some of the complexities, and opportunities, surrounding these issues, and set the stage for moving forward, with clear advise and recommendations for consideration.

## Panel Session 1: Enabling Conditions for Private Sector Leadership

Held on 27 August, this panel session explored 'Enabling Conditions for Private Sector Leadership in Sustainable Marine Tourism', and was moderated by Ms. Rili Djohani from the Coral Triangle Center, with the following industry leaders and experts:

- Mr. Francis Lee, President, Raffles Marina Singapore.
- Mr. H. Masagoes Ismail Ning, Chairman, Pacto Ltd.
- Mr. Franciscus Welirang, Director, PT Indofood Sukses Makmur Tbk, Founder of Indonesia Philanthropy Association.

In this panel discussion, the panelists were asked their thoughts on what key enabling conditions need to be in place to engage the private tourism sector in investing in and developing sustainable tourism practices and operations that support the preservation of marine natural resources and benefit communities. They were also asked to provide advice on how the CTI-CFF initiative can proactively follow up and provide an avenue for this private sector engagement, and in what way private sector leaders can set an example to others.

### It was *recognized* that:

- It is difficult for the private sector to embrace sustainability unless they see it with a long term vision. Their priority is profit/survival, especially after any large-scale investment is made. Hence, codes of conduct, laws/public regulations, self-regulation/roles of trade associations and NGO's and community as partners will always be critical to shaping private sector investment models and modus operandi.
- Not only does the private sector need to be aware of sustainability but also local communities and all sectors of tourism (employees, guests etc.).
- With more than 80% of our biodiversity in the region already becoming lost, a sense of urgency needs to be conveyed to the private sector of their important role in reversing this trend.
- The governments of the CT6 nations play a key role in formulating effective and conducive regulations, and enforcing their implementation (at a macro scale).



Consensus emerged from the speakers regarding the key enabling conditions to support private sector engagement in sustainable tourism, and the *recommendations* were:

- There needs to be coordination and cooperation between the private and public sectors on sustaining business and development through trade associations, chambers of commerce and other alliances.
- There needs to be consistency and enforcement of government regulations at various levels (central, local, district, etc.)
- Certain areas / sites will have specific needs which will require specific codes of conduct (adjusted to local needs). Regulations are key to achieving this and 'we need to start right' (with the role of CTI-CFF).
- Central and local governments need to align systems in order to promote appropriate sustainable private sector engagement for example aligning marine spatial planning with development goals, and ensuring clarity for investors entering an area.
- There needs to be standardization of a framework for the private sector to work effectively with governments and communities. The private sector should work hand in hand with government as partners (at the micro scale). For example: the Coordinating Ministry of Maritime and Marine Affairs (MMAF), and Ministry of Tourism should hold discussions and socialize new regulations with GAHAWISRI (the Indonesian Marine Tourism Association) before implementation. The Chamber of Commerce or trade associations in each CT 6 nation would also provide an avenue for such engagement.
- The creation of a CTI-CFF business advisory council/board or a Business Development Council in Coral Triangle marine tourism is highly recommended, and development of such a body should be a priority.

Other elements were also identified that would provide much needed support to the private sector, such as:

- Support identifying investment opportunities mapping business opportunities in marine tourism across the Coral Triangle, and targeting engagement in particular areas. This would provide a level playing field to create value added business models.
- Having carrying capacity studies available, i.e. scale and scope of an area in terms of sustaining tourism and development infrastructure (ideal number of visitors etc.).
- Such pre-planning approaches and information guidance would be of enormous help to private sector investors.

The tri-motherhood precept thinking shared by Francis Lee summed these considerations up as follows: (i) Extinction is forever, endangerment is reversible, and sustainability must be rebooted. Conservation is critical. (ii) Sustainable development supports this reboot; it enables value creation, recognition, integration, management and realization of imperatives to sustainability, (iii) All actions require Good Governance, which must underpin all sustainable tourism activities in the region.



## **Panel Session 2: Best Practices for Responsible Tourism**

Held on day two of the event, this panel session explored 'Best Practices for Responsible Marine and Coastal Tourism', and was moderated by Mr. Cipto Gunawan, a marine ecotourism assessment, development, and marketing consultant, with the following industry leaders and experts:

- Mr. Luigi Cabrini, Chairman of the Board of Directors of the Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC) and an Advisor to the Secretary-General of the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO).
- Ms. Astrid Haryati, CEO, Terra Lumen Indonesia.
- Ms. Angelique Songco, Superintendent, Tubbataha Reefs Natural Park.
- Mr. Paul Holthus, World Ocean Council.

This panel session involved industry leaders, and sustainable best practice experts, to learn their thoughts and recommendations for developing / establishing tourism sustainability principles and guidelines for tourism enterprises in the Coral Triangle – and how to encourage / incentivize the adoption of these best practice approaches, particularly in areas within or adjacent to Marine Protected Areas (MPAs). The session aimed to identify what mechanisms should be promoted / adopted to increase and encourage private tourism sector engagement and support to the CTI-CFF goals, and in particular how the private sector might proactively support the effective management of MPAs throughout the region.

#### Through the panel discussions it was *recognized* that:

- Guidelines to support sustainable tourism development are important.
- Development of any guidelines needs to involve appropriate industry representatives, finance investors, tour operators and local community representatives from the beginning.
- Lack of a common vision, both at the level of local park communities or world-wide industries, will be an obstacle to guideline development and implementation. It will therefore be necessary to take the time and effort to create a common vision of what sustainable practices are in order to be successful at getting buy-in and implementation.
- Private sector parties need to have the flexibility to work on implementing the guidelines at whatever level they are at, gradually improving or implementing more elements as they are able (for example, small operators have fewer resources and may not have the means to implement all guidelines at once).
- The guidelines need to be relevant at a range of scales (appropriate for small scale investors and large scale operations).
- Conflicting or inconsistent policies and regulations across geographic or political zones are an obstacle to
  implementation. Therefore it will be important for multinational companies/ industries to be able to
  apply the guidelines across borders in the Coral Triangle, and the roll out of guidelines should not be
  hampered or complicated by nationalized disconnected policies.
- For this reason, the CTI-CFF provides an important and appropriate vehicle through which guidelines can be both developed and implemented.



#### Key *recommendations* were:

- To involve appropriate industry representatives, finance investors, tour operators and local community representatives in the development of the guidelines, to promote buy in and ensure they are possible to implement.
- Ensure there is a shared vision between industries, and across nations at the large scale, as well as among communities, operators and local governments and the small scale.
- Ensure the guidelines are feasible, practical and enforceable.
- Concurrent with guidelines development and production, there needs to be great information, awareness and education provision to investors, the financial community and urban nature tourists, in understanding what should be implemented and why.

"The application of sustainable tourism standards is crucial, as maritime tourism is considered the largest industry in the world and has become the fastest-growing economic sector."

Dr. Sudirman Saad, Director General of Director General of Coastal, Marine and Small Islands, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (Antarabali.com)<sup>1</sup>

## Panel Session 3: Branding and Marketing the Coral Triangle

Held on day two of the event, this panel session explored 'Branding and Marketing the Coral Triangle as a Global Sustainable Tourism Destination', and was moderated by Ms. Malyn Molina, Managing Director, EON with the following industry leaders and experts:

- Jim Dion, Director of Tourism, National Geographic Society.
- Charlotte Prowse, Partner, Destination Marketing Store.
- Kevin Austin, Managing Director, Timor Holidays.
- Steve White, Editor for Action Asia.

This panel session aimed to learn from industry leaders their thoughts and experiences of how destinations (and groups of destinations, such as key areas of conservation value in the coral triangle) could become 'branded' for marketing purposes, and what advantages such a branding approach could bring to these destinations. It explored their thoughts and recommendations on how the different marine tourism sectors (airlines, resorts, live aboard, divers etc) could be engaged / involved in this collaborative marketing effort, and considered how, and what role, the CTI-CFF could have in supporting public-private initiatives to promote a Coral Triangle nature-based brand.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> CTI-CFF Forum Calls For Application Of Sustainable Maritime TourismStandard. Antarabali.com. Friday, 28 August, 2015.

### Through this panel discussion it was *recognized* that:

- The development of any type of 'brand' requires an understanding of the 'story' you are selling; the 'journey' you are inspiring.
- It is important not to put administrative boundaries around the brand. It is about the customer and their journey through the landscape.
- Sites and experiences for branding need to be self-identified by geography, not by administrative/political boundaries/country borders. For example, journeys can be based on common history, art, food, and traditions. To this end it will be important to work with regional communities to self-identify what their common geographic region is, and what scale and scope of visitation enables this holistic experience.
- Whilst marine tourism may often focus on the assets of the region that are under the water, any
  branding should not be limited to this. There are a range of meaningful assets and experiences above
  the water that need to be included (for example: boating, sailing, paddling, birding, cultural attractions
  etc are all part of the potential experience for the visitor). It is therefore important to identify and
  inventory the range of assets available that can be taken to market.
- Local people are the curators of their own place-based authenticity. Communities and site based stakeholders need to be provided with the tools to identify what is wonderful about their place; they will need support and platforms to develop and manage their own stories and messages as part of the branding process.
- Some of the best nature based brands out there can be found in East Africa, the Amazon and Borneo, and they are based on dramatic and compelling imagery of iconic places, species and landscapes, with a history of exploration and adventure.
- Branding requires real content and real information.
- Pictures, images and videos are absolutely critical components of messaging and branding. There are a wealth of resources out there, and these need to be appropriately captured and shaped into the stories you are selling; to include iconic underwater and over water photography.

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- To be clear on your values in any branding effort.
- Inventory your assets consistent with your values.
- Do research to identify your target markets, before you decide on your brand.
- Work from the local community up any brand needs to create an emotional link with the customer for marketing.
- Self-identify by geography, not by administrative/political boundaries/country borders.
- Any branding needs to draw people in emotionally, at the same time as having a strong shelf-life.
- The branding should make a simple and direct connection, and not overwhelm in stimulus.
- Ensure there is control of imagery and control of channels of communication for all marketing avenues.
- Bring together community representatives and the private sector for all branding design and development processes.
- Experiences had on the ground, are powerful. Get those stories out for marketing.
- Recognize that many visitors will be willing to pay more if they know it will help preserve the place they
  are visiting do not only brand and market that, ensure it is also fully applied.
- Remember always that the brand and marketing is only one part of the equation for sustainable success the experience must also effectively 'deliver' on that story / experience / expectation.

## **Open Sessions**

During the two days of the conference, ten Open Sessions were held, exploring a range of sustainable tourism related issues, challenges and opportunities — including the importance of linking sustainable tourism to local industries and communities; promoting corporate social responsibility (CSR) to support marine conservation; exploring the role of voluntourism and eco-certification in advancing the goals of the CTI-CFF, and ensuring symbiotic relationships exist between coastal tourism, MPAs and sustainable fisheries.

## **Session 1: Branding and Marketing the Coral Triangle**

Held on day one, this session explored creating multi-site international travel packages for branding and marketing the Coral Triangle. The session looked at innovative ways to market the Coral Triangle as a global sustainable marine tourism destination to key audiences, and the available multimedia tools and platforms to do so. It looked at the role of branding and marketing as well as existing and available marketing tactics and strategies to help position the Coral Triangle as an international nature-based tourism brand, increase awareness on the Coral Triangle and sustainability issues related to tourism, and spur engagement among tourism operators, consumers, and the media to support sustainable marine tourism in the region.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- How to reframe the relevant marketing information in order to adapt it to a target audience.
- How to exemplify cases that show eco-tourism has high yields.
- How to ensure people access and spend time on digital platforms that market the area(s).
- The different roles of digital versus traditional media.

#### Key *consensus* emerged that:

- Digital communication platforms are a powerful way to promote the CT region.
- The marketing outreach has to be tailored to target audiences.
- Storytelling is key to marketing the CT region and to engaging target audiences.
- Organic assets are already in place and could be utilized appropriately ('local voices inspire global audiences')
- Tourism is not education but should inspire guests to engage. Engagement means empowerment.
- Data and existing examples show that eco-tourism can be financially viable, and the nature based tourist tends to spend more.
- Content marketing is key, and the four steps to achieving this are: reach → inspire → engage → connect.

This session was moderated by: Malyn Molina [EON]. The speakers were: Mr. Johnny Langenheim [Managing Director, Spindrift]; James Dion [Director of Tourism Programs, National Geographic Society-Maps]; Marc-Antoine Dunais [CEO, PT Catalyze Communications]; Carl Solomon [Destination Marketing Store].



#### **Session 2: Eco-certification**

Held on day one, this session explored eco-certification for sustainable marine tourism businesses. Certification is widely recognized as an important tool for ensuring sustainable construction and operations of hotels and other tourism businesses. This session learned about the range of certification programs available in the Coral Triangle, and the impact of certification on marketing and package production. It also explored what it would take to implement / expand some form of sustainable marine eco-certification initiative Coral Triangle wide.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- The desirability of certification by both governments and consumers.
- The positive impact of certification, both financially and ecologically.
- How certification is fostering capacity building, be it training or promoting a sense of accountability.
- How certification strengthens regulatory frameworks/ promotes an ecologically aware code of conduct.
- How certification cannot just be a rubber stamp, it needs to be made desirable to business owners and offer real traction in terms of sustainable outputs.
- The pros and cons of paid certification schemes vs. free certification schemes.

#### Key *consensus* emerged that:

- Eco-certification needs to focus on quality on not quantity. Certification answers a demand for authenticity. The term 'sustainable' or 'responsible tourism' needs to have meaning and to truly be mitigating negative impacts on the environment and / or people.
- In order to have any form of certification there needs to be recognized and clear 'standards' against which to assess. Sustainable tourism needs to be implemented in a measurable and credible way.
- Certification helps tourists identify where they should be giving their business, and rewards businesses by bringing in customers who value ecological sustainability.
- There is a need for a monitoring component in all and any certification processes, i.e. annual and objective assessments.
- There are a range of advantages and disadvantages to both paid and free certification schemes, and a range of approaches needs to be available to cater for the wide ranging needs of target businesses.
- Certification processes can help establish positive relationships with the governments. Standards promoted can influence government policies, which is ultimately beneficial to both conservation causes and a tour operator's business.
- The criteria set by certifications can be adopted and written into policy to enforce these standards. It can also result in government support (an example from Australia shows that is a business is certified by 'Eco Tourism Australia' it can obtain a 15 year permit to operate on the Great Barrier Reef versus a 3 year permit for non-certified businesses).
- Certification can be part of a wider management approach, involving training and capacity building, guideline production and implementation.

This session was moderated by: Eleanor Carter [Sustainable Solutions International Consulting]. The speakers were: Luigi Cabrini [Global Sustainable Tourism Council & Advisor to UN World Tourism Organization]; Rod Hillman [Eco Tourism Australia]; James Harvey [Green Fins].



## **Session 3: Cruise Impacts and Innovations**

Held on day one, this session showcased sustainability initiatives by the cruise line and associated boating marine leisure related tourism industry, and examined the economic impacts of this type of tourism on Coral Triangle nations, as well as the role of corporate social and environmental responsibility in decision making by cruise consumers.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around the challenges facing the liveaboard, cruise and marine leisure industry. These include:

- A lack of standardization. For example, the implementation of harbor regulations set at the central (highest level) government is oftentimes different from interpretations made by various local government bodies, and each harbor has its own rules and regulation. Enforcement is also weak, and these challenges create an un-level playing field for businesses to survive and flourish.
- Rapid development in some destination areas does not necessarily support sustainability, e.g. hotels, and other big investments can undermine the value of an experience in an area.
- Oftentimes there are only minimal economic benefits from the marine leisure industry conferred to local
  communities, and this can lead to local communities being unhappy with boats/tourists coming into
  'their territory'; whilst best practice liveaboard operators do go to the same destinations and build up
  long term relationships with local communities.
- Due to limited awareness and a lack of enforcement, the marine leisure industry can oftentimes still causes considerable negative impacts on the marine environment.

Despite these challenges, there have however been a range of innovations in the industry to date. These include trade associations (such as GAHAWISRI, JANGKAR, Blue Water Alliance) that promote standardization and self-regulation for members, and enables parties to join forces to promote sustainability of their businesses and of the environment.

#### Key consensus emerged that:

- It is imperative for industry leaders to 'lead by example' exemplifying good governance, self-regulation, long term engagement with and investment in local communities.
- Such leaders need to ensure they apply all best practice approaches (such as adhering to marine pollution conventions, appropriate anchoring sites, potable water conservation, provision of education for both crews and guests, waste recycling and engagement with the local communities that they visit).
- The CTI-CFF has an important role in this regard, as a convener, facilitating all stakeholders in the marine tourism industry in Coral Triangle.
- The Aseanarean (comparable to the Mediterranean and Caribbean) is richer in marine biodiversity than all other destinations. Therefore branding the Coral Triangle as global marine tourism destination is strategic and beneficial for the cruise and marine leisure industries of the region.

This session was moderated by: Rili Djohani [Coral Triangle Center]. The speakers were: Ismail Ning [PACTO Ltd.]; Francis Lee [Raffles Marina]; Edi Frommenwiler [Pindito Liveaboards].



## **Session 4: Dive Tourism Impacts and Innovations**

Held on day one, this session explored dive tourism as a primary source of income to the Coral Triangle region, recognizing that divers will likely continue to grow in number as long as the coral and fish species remain healthy. The session discussed the growing body of best practices for scuba diving, snorkeling, and boating as well as innovative initiatives that engage divers with marine conservation initiatives and with local communities.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- The unprecedented growth of dive operators, tourists and facilities in the Coral Triangle.
- The potential positive economic, environmental and social-cultural effects of dive tourism.
- The importance of establishing standard operating procedures or eco-certification for dive centers.
- The importance of providing training / education for dive operators, to ensure their clients are environmentally aware tourists.
- The role of dive tourism operators supporting legislative change.
- The importance and role of dive operators providing livelihoods for local communities.

During this session it was *recognized* that the majority of dive operations are found in the equatorial zone, located near MPAs; and that greater positive economic impacts and reduced economic leakage tends to occur with locally owned operations, or where there have been good relationships developed and proactive engagement of the local communities by the non-national operators.

#### Key *consensus* emerged that:

- The pricing of diving (and undervaluing) can lead to reduced standards and safety considerations, and closed operations.
- Competition around sites is keeping prices artificially low.
- Local involvement and education is critical to maintain sustainable practices and minimize economic leakage.
- It is important to support initiatives in targeted ways (otherwise resources can be spread too thin), and to support dive shops in their local communities to educate people.
- It is important to encourage resorts and retail members to partner with a non-profit organization.
- The private sectors can step in to regulate when the government doesn't have the resources.
- It is critical to support the maintenance of local cultures and utilize these as part of the tourist experience.

This session also noted that the Indonesian government has recently signed a regulation for standards relating to dive operators. The regulation will be fully implemented by 2016, and the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries in Indonesia have developed a dive site classification based on certain conditions, such as which operators are permitted to dive in that area and the requirement of the dive guide and the equipment. The session was moderated by: Mary Cody [Bureau of Ocean and Energy Management, US DOI]. The speakers were: Judi Lowe [ARC Center of Research]; Cipto Gunawan [Sustainable Dive Consultant, Indonesia]; Paul Tanner [PADI Regional Manager].





## **Session 5: Corporate Social Responsibility**

Held on day two, this session explored a range of approaches in which corporate social responsibility (CSR) can be leveraged to support both marine and coastal conservation efforts across the region, and to preserve the natural areas important as key tourism destinations. This session aimed to highlight successful CSR practices and explore the possibility of replicating best practices wherein companies operating in coastal areas were able to implement sustainability practices throughout their entire operations.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around business examples (such as lodge operations) that utilize part of their revenue for conservation purposes, and galvanize additional funding where possible to support conservation initiatives in their localities.

#### During this session it was *recognized* that:

- Undertaking such conservation efforts as a business is important and appealing to visitors (with 90% satisfaction ratings recognized).
- Environmentally responsible choices must be supported by the senior management of any organization, and should be built into their vision and values statements (it cannot be an 'add-on' by only a few representatives of the organization).
- Environmentally responsive choices require specific investment planning to execute. Costs must be
  recouped to balance the bottom line. This takes creative thinking specific to the business need and the
  environment within which it resides and must be planned for.
- Environmental responsibility combined with educational/training opportunities that are integrated with local community employment and support opportunities tend to work most effectively.
- Investing in youth and educational community programs helps extend responsible choices and educated support through generations.
- A like-minded and carefully chosen board of directors is vital to the long-term success of any CSR endeavor, and improves the ability to raise funds beyond direct business related outputs to maintain community support and conservation programs.
- For business operations in and around MPAs, clear planning for the future 'bottom-line' must be undertaken in line with the specific MPA conditions and principals.
- Any supported activities need to use credible scientific methods (social and biophysical), and should
  ensure monitoring to provide feedback / show areas of success / lessons learned. If / where possible,
  business could / should align with universities / other professional institutions to strengthen their own
  credibility of work.



- New generations of resorts attracted to profit increasingly recognize the appeal of environmentally sustainable operations (from a marketing perspective), but they do not always plan, design and execute such approaches effectively. Businesses must plan for and execute mitigation of their damage as part of their sustainability plans. There is little monitoring or law that is overseeing this behavior (leading to potential 'green washing') and the industry needs to be better able to highlight real versus surface level impacts that businesses make.
- CSR approaches that involve tourists need to be engaging and fun. People are not there to study but to have fun. Education can be fun (such as free dive incentives).
- It is important for businesses to celebrate the conservation wins they are involved in, and to let everyone know the successes of their efforts.

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- Businesses need to be creative and people within businesses who want to promote CSR need to develop a clear business model that emphasizes environmental responsibility and profit.
- Businesses engaging in CSR need an attractive approach to build constituents to reach their market.
- Businesses need to plan ahead to mitigate the challenges they will face, and recouping the costs of addressing any challenges needs to be built into any business model.
- Governments of the CT6 nations have a critical role to play in promoting and supporting companies that are making efforts to undertake conservation support in their areas, and / or undertaking CSR to support the marine and coastal environment and associated communities across the region.

This session was moderated by: Arwandrija Rukma [CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat]. The speakers were: Cecilie Benjamin [Walindi Plantation Resort]; Mariglo Laririt [El Nido Resorts]; Ralph Dixon [YTL Corporation Berhad].

"By working together with local communities, authorizes, as well as NGOs, the private sector... could support conservation efforts while at the same time keep their business[es] profitable"

Ketut Sarjana Putra, Conservation International (Jakarta Post)<sup>2</sup>



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Key business players to maintain coral triangle sustainably. Jakarta Post. Desy Nurhayati. 01 September 2015.

\_

## Session 6: Linking Sustainable Tourism to Local Industries and Communities

Held on day two, this session recognized that creating connections between hospitality and other local industries is key to increasing the local economic and social benefits of tourism. The session explored the successes and challenges experienced in forging more integrated local economies centered around sustainable marine tourism. As part of the effort to highlight private sector leadership in this field, the organizers recognized private companies from the Coral Triangle member countries who have successfully integrated sustainable marine tourism practices and linked these to their local communities.

#### During this session it was *recognized* that:

- Key drivers that encourage entrepreneurs to invest in sustainable marine tourism and link with local communities are related to having a responsibility towards the local community and environment and fulfilling communities' needs whilst protecting and enhancing the environment.
- There is an interdependence between entrepreneurs and local communities, and this interdependence needs to be recognized and embraced.
- The 3 key elements to successfully linking sustainable tourism to local industries and communities are:
  - (i) Take the time to know and understand the community (gain trust),
  - (ii) Identify what the needs of the community are,
  - (iii) Work to incorporate the meeting of these needs into the business model, in a way that supports a) the community, b) the environment and c) the business.

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- Business operations working alongside local coastal communities need to be highly environmentally sensitive, including high-level waste water treatment systems, collecting rain water for use in kitchens and bathrooms, using solar energy (e.g. solar panels) etc. The business must not contribute to damaging the environment and ecology upon which the local communities depend.
- Business should help provide livelihood opportunities for local communities not only through immediate term job opportunities, but also in the long term by making it more profitable for the community to protect the resources around them rather than destroying them.
- Creating awareness through education is an important factor for long term protection of the environment, and businesses need to support the provision of education and awareness activities.

This session was moderated by: Anne Nelson [NOAA]. The speakers were: Chris Brown [Reef Seen]; David McCann [Scuba Junkie]; James Harvey on behalf of David Joyce [Evolution Dive].



## Session 7: Symbiotic relationships: coastal tourism, MPAs and fisheries

Held on day two, this session explored building symbiotic relationships between coastal tourism, MPAs and sustainable fisheries. The interface between coastal tourism and the nearby ocean—both in terms of artisanal and commercial fishing pressure and the conservation of resources through marine protected areas – was discussed. It explored the value of protected areas for tourism businesses and ways in which tourism, when done sustainably, can support and contribute to the success of both sustainable fishing and strengthening of the Coral Triangle MPA System and its implementation. The session highlighted how well managed MPAs contribute both to sustainable fishing and successful marine tourism, and also showed how the implementation of the Coral Triangle MPA System can be assisted by tourism best practices while augmenting tourism demand in the region.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- The importance of local community involvement in MPAs.
- The need for educating/convincing local communities, industries and governments to support MPAs.
- The importance and opportunities available for learning lessons from effectively managed MPAs (such as Misool, Tubbataha, Batangas).
- The importance of appropriate design and management of MPAs to accommodate the needs of fisheries (food security) and coastal tourism.
- The importance of effective enforcement of MPA rules/ guidelines to support all sectors (conservation, tourism and fisheries).
- The importance of local tourism sector involvement in managing MPAs.

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- Key to ensuring symbiotic relationships between MPAs, coastal tourism and fisheries, is the development of sustainable tourism guidelines and certification programs.
- MPAs need to establish user fee systems to tourists to support management costs (in a way that funds
  can be directly channeled to MPA management, and developed in collaboration with private sector
  partners at the site).
- It is advantageous to expand/implement voluntourism programs in MPAs, thus capitalizing on the skills coming into an area, as well as the financial support such approaches can provide.
- It is important to link MPA management effectiveness with tourism stakeholder participation.
- Sustainable tourism enterprises that provide direct assistance and engagement with conservation should be promoted (such as the Misool example).

Finally the CTMPAS (Coral Triangle MPA System) approach was highlighted as providing four categories of MPAs: 1-flagship sites, 2-priority development sites, 3- regionally important sites, 4-local level sites. The CTMPAS program can work alongside the tourism and fisheries sectors to promote ranging sites appropriately (i.e. flagship sites for dive tourism etc). This session was moderated by: Hendra Siry [Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Indonesia]. The speakers were: Chiara Zuccarino-Crowe [NOAA]; Alan White [TNC]; Angelique Songco [Tubbataha Reef Natural Park Manager].



## **Session 8: Training and Support for Local Communities and Cultural Tourism**

Capacity issues are a key challenge restricting the ability of local communities to engage in coastal and marine entrepreneurship. Many of the most attractive visitor destinations are to be found in remote areas, where training opportunities and tourism schools are absent. Held on day two, this session explored how to strengthen the capacity of indigenous communities that, in turn, will result in effective local leadership in the development of sustainable tourism enterprises. As part of the effort to highlight private sector leadership in this field, the organizers recognized private companies from the Coral Triangle member countries who have successfully integrated sustainable marine tourism practices and linked these to their local communities.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- The importance of providing training for local communities in order to integrate / capitalize on sustainable tourism opportunities.
- The challenges of combating language and cultural barriers in community led initiatives.
- The importance for any incoming business entrepreneurs to gain the trust of local communities.
- The importance of integrating eco-tourism businesses directly with conservation.

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- Business entrepreneurs need to ensure there is a long term commitment to communities in the areas they want to invest, and appreciate the value they have to offer.
- Trust building is a key component for communities working with private sector.
- Strengthening local capacity for ecotourism and conservation engagement is critical, so that it is sustainable and continues to grow.
- It is appropriate to use non-formal (non-classroom based, non-technical) training for capacity-building for local people. Build on what is already known. Capitalize on what is already there.
- Peer to peer learning is also effective and can be relatively inexpensive as an approach to capacity building (i.e. fishermen teaching fishermen).
- Businesses must be economically viable but also sustainable.
- Support is required not only in establishing community led operations, but also in marketing (i.e. web based approaches, use of social media etc) and management.
- Ensuring community ownership and management reduces economic leakage and maximizes benefit streams to local communities.

This session was moderated by: Jackie Thomas [WWF Pacific]. The speakers were: Patson Baea [Oravae Cottages]; Marthen Welly [Coral Triangle Center]; Francisco Mesina [Dive Timor Lorosae].



## **Session 9: Supporting Conservation Financing Through Sustainable Tourism**

Held on day two, this session explored the challenges to investing in coastal marine tourism in the coral triangle and the ways in which the six Coral Triangle countries can support the private sector in overcoming investment hurdles in sustainable marine tourism.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- The importance of having clear, transparent and effective administration of trust funds and other funding mechanisms.
- The role of the Blue economy as an approach for the private sector to invest in sustainable marine tourism.
- The importance of knowing where and how benefits are produced that can shape investment decisions.
- The importance of recognizing that tourism at the right scale can sustainably fund rehabilitation and restoration programs.

#### Key *consensus* emerged that:

- It is critical to have a good administration of trust funds and other financing mechanisms. For example, Yayasan Kehati managed a 16 billion USD endowment fund, providing 16% interest per annum. Other examples have worked with the Indonesian Stock Exchange (IDX) Index: ETF-SRI (Sustainable Responsible Investment) worth 100 million USD.
- The main actors in any financing mechanism are the local communities who should benefit from rich marine biodiversity, and not only the private sector actors working in the area.
- Mechanisms to ensure benefit flows are appropriate and targeted include: (i) investing in community
  education, (ii) implementing conducive rules for marine conservation (governance) to capitalize on
  funding streams available, (iii) develop community managed marine tourism, not only big businesses, (iv)
  ensuring there is concurrent commitment from government to develop sustainable sectors in a given
  area (i.e. sustainable tourism, fisheries etc) and reduce government focus on GDP growth through nonsustainable activities such as mining, oil and gas.
- Knowing where and how benefits are produced can shape investment decisions. Such information
  informs how to generate funding, but also where to invest those funds. For example, the TNC project
  with Carnival and Microsoft 'Mapping Ocean Wealth' has provided a range of information tools and
  resources for mapping marine ecosystems values, and such information needs to be utilized in the
  development of financing mechanisms and targeted streaming of funds.
- Funding mechanisms are not only large scale and holistic. Tourism at the right scale can sustainably fund rehabilitation and restoration programs independently. For example, the Gaya Island Resort Marine Center is self-funded by its ecotourism guided tours and snorkeling/diving trips.

This session was moderated by: Andrew Soles [The Nature Conservancy]. The speakers were: M.S. Semibiring [Kehati Foundation]; Dewi Smaragdina [Blue Economy Foundation]; Robert Brumbaugh [The Nature Conservancy]; Scott Mayback [Gaya Resorts, Sabah, Malaysia].



"The private sector needs to understand that no tourism is possible without sustainability [and] when the government lacks resources, the private sector should stand hand in hand to protect the area". Ismail Ning, Chairman of the Indonesian Marine Tourism Association, Gahawisri (Jakarta Globe)<sup>3</sup>

## Session 10: Traveler's Philanthropy and Volun-tourism

Held on day two, this session explored 'Traveler's Philanthropy and Volun-tourism for Cultural and Marine Tourism'. Travelers' philanthropy, a relatively new component of responsible travel, is growing rapidly as more tourism businesses and tourists donate 'time, talent or treasure' to support local community and conservation projects. This session looked at successful travelers' philanthropy programs run by individual companies as well as collaboratively by businesses in a tourism destination. Participants explored the practical issues involved in creating well-run travelers' philanthropy programs for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

The presentations given by the speakers in this session generated *discussion* around:

- Promoting volunteerism as a means to leverage funding for conservation efforts.
- How projects can be replicated in locations that are experiencing similar issues.
- How volunteerism can balance the needs of a community and the wants of the tourist.
- The importance of taking into consideration the skills or qualities of a volunteer.
- How to provide incentives for tourists to participate in meaningful tourism.

#### Key *consensus* emerged that:

- It is important to go beyond simply selling an experience that is attractive to tourists it needs to be beneficial to conservation efforts and supporting the local community's needs.
- The impact of volunteerism on local communities will vary depending on location, the skills of the tourist, and whether the program is long term or short term.
- When designing your voluntourism program or project, it is important to understand the purpose of the tourist. Are they coming in for just an hour or two and serving strictly a financial purpose? Or do you need to give them skills, or use existing skills, in order to carry out your program? Prepare accordingly to ensure you meet both the tourists purpose and the conservation purpose at hand.
- Conservation efforts supported by travellers philanthropy can be funded through skills building workshops, reef taxes, school field trips, and internships.
- Volun-tourism can provide two-fold benefits, it can promote stewardship within the participant but can also answer the needs of the community.

This session was moderated by: Hesti Widodo [Coral Triangle Center]. The speakers were: Julian Hyde [Reefcheck Malaysia]; Lope Calanog [ADB CTI-Southeast Asia Project]; Delphine Robbe [Gili Eco Trust]; Krystyna Krasowska [ID Guides].



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sustainable tourism seen as key to Coral Triangle Conservation. Jakarta Globe. Baston Gokkson. 01 September, 2015

### **Side Events**

In addition to the roundtables, panel sessions and open sessions, a range of Side Events took place during this fourth Regional Business Forum.

## The CTI-CFF Local Government Network 1st Executive Committee Meeting

Hosted by the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, in collaboration with the Indonesia CTI-CFF National Coordinating Committee, Coral Triangle Center, USAID, US DOI and WWF, this was the first ever meeting of the CTI-CFF Local Government Network (LGN) Executive Committee. The LGN is a network of local government champions, identified and empowered, who promote and implement the goals of the CTI-CFF at the community level through collaboration and partnership. The meeting built upon the outcomes and agreements made at the 3rd CTI-CFF Local Government Network meeting in Alotau, Papua New Guinea held in March 2015.

Facilitated by: Dr. Arwandrija Rukma, Coordinator, CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, the meeting was attended by 52 local government leaders and representatives of Indonesia and the Coral Triangle Countries, including: Wakatobi Mayor, Hugua, as the Chair of CTI-CFF Local Government Network (LGN); representatives from the Ministry of Science Technology and Innovation (MOSTI) Malaysia; the Regional Secretariat of CTI-CFF; the Indonesian National Coordinating Committee (NCC); USAID Regional Development Mission for Asia (RDMA); US-Department of Interior; WWF Indonesia; TNC Indonesia; the Coral Triangle Center and partners' representatives and observers.

#### At the meeting it was *recognized* that:

- Local governments have instrumental roles in achieving the CTI-CFF goals, objectives and programs.
- There are a wide range of benefits and opportunities available to local government agencies who join the LGN forum.
- There is an expectation that CT Local Government Network will play greater, more active roles, in implementing both the RPOA and NPOAs through further practical and strategic solutions support for implementation.
- The CTI-CFF CFF Regional Secretariat corroborated its support for the LGN and its development at both regional and national levels, leading to reaffirmed commitment from partners, especially WWF, TNC, CTC, USAID and USDOI.



The meeting also achieved *consensus* that:

- There is a need to strengthen the networking capacity of the LGN by developing activities that will strengthen its members' scope.
- There is a need to list activities and communicate opportunities to ensure the involvement of all stakeholders, especially communities, in capacity building efforts and opportunities.
- The development of a clear communication strategy is a priority for the LGN, to facilitate and enable interaction among members of the CTI-CFF Local Government Network through regular meetings and other means.
- Participation and support from non-Local Government institutions are welcome and will be accommodated through Associate Members status.
- There was commitment to circulate further information about joining the LGN following increased requests from local governments to expand membership.

At this meeting the draft CTI-CFF LGN statutes were also circulated and reviewed, and it was agreed that these statutes will be shared at the upcoming CTI-CFF LGN General Assembly to be promoted for adoption, as will all the above consensus recommendations made. These outputs will be communicated to the members of CTI-CFF Local Government Network by the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, and will be finalized at the General Assembly meeting that will be held in Wakatobi in March/April 2016. The above outputs will also be reported to the upcoming 11th CTI-CFF Senior Officials Meeting in Manado in November 2015.

#### **CTI-CFF Women Leaders Forum**

The Women Leaders Forum (WLF) was established following the 10th CTI-CFF Senior Officials Meeting and 5th Ministerial Meeting in Manado, Indonesia in May 2014, as a Forum envisioned to: (i) function as a peer-learning network for women who are playing key leadership roles in sustaining the marine resources of the Coral Triangle region; (ii) recognize the achievement of grassroots women leaders who are championing marine conservation in the six Coral Triangle countries; and (iii) serve as a platform to build the capacity of women from the Coral Triangle to take leadership roles in preserving and sustaining the region's unique marine and coastal resources.

This WLF entrepreneurs' roundtable was moderated by Ms. Eleanor Carter from Sustainable Solutions International Consulting, with leading women entrepreneurs:

- Ibu Ir. Sri Atmini, Secretary of Directorate of the Marine, Coasts and Small Islands, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Indonesia
- Ibu Dewi Smaragdina, Founder and Chairman Blue Economy Foundation
- Ibu Suryani Mile, Chairwoman, Indonesian Liveaboard Association
- Ibu Astrid Haryati, CEO Terra Lumen Indonesia



The roundtable aimed to learn from these women entrepreneurs who have successfully catalyzed sustainable and environment-friendly businesses that support and sustain marine resources across Indonesia. By sharing lessons learned and highlighting best practices, the roundtable aimed to engage more women to pursue sustainable businesses that conserve and sustain marine resources. Key questions being addressed during the roundtable included: identifying key elements to success in setting up a business that is environmentally friendly and promotes sustainable use of resources; identifying and understanding the specific challenges encountered as a woman entrepreneurs and how such challenges could be overcome; and what enabling policy conditions could help encourage more women entrepreneurs to venture into sustainable marine tourism businesses.

#### During the discussions it was recognized that:

- Women can bring special strengths to the industry in terms of professional decision making skills, their 'caring capacity', and an ability to see things from different perspectives.
- Limits can often be self-imposed upon women. Professional success is hard work for everyone, and seeing gender as an obstacle must be overcome in order to push through, work hard and reach your destination.
- For many women across the region is can be challenging to combine the roles of wife and mother with a profession, especially if it is a career that requires a lot of travel.
- It is important to recognise women's multiple roles as wives, mothers and businesswomen, and to help them access opportunities that enable them to balance these roles.
- A wide range of programs are being implemented across the region to encourage and support women's
  involvement in coastal and marine conservation and sustainability enterprises. For example, the
  Coremap initiative is proactively providing capacity building support to women across the region to
  promote business entrepreneurship and active engagement in marine and coastal issues.
- Encouraging women to learn to swim and snorkel is an important step for many in overcoming a common fear of the marine environment amongst women in Indonesia. By learning what is under the water, and how to enjoy it, this enables them to be inspired by the marine environment and in turn want to protect it.

#### Key *advice shared* for upcoming women entering the sustainability sector were:

- Work hard, persevere, do not limit yourself
- Ensure you have the highest standards of integrity
- Always learn, study and never give up. Be fearless. There is no easy road to success.
- Have strength. Do what you love and your passion will show.



## **Business Advisory Council Meeting**

This meeting explored the potential for establishing a collaborative Business Advisory Council (BAC) for CTI-CFF activities moving forward. The concept for having a BAC emerged initially from previous regional business forums, and was further endorsed through discussions at this fourth RBF.

This invite only meeting was attended by 17 participants, including representatives from each of the six CT nations national coordinating committees (NCCs) as well as representatives from the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat and national Ministries, NGOs (CT, CTC, WWF and TNC) and ADB.

#### The meeting generated *consensus* that:

- Each of the NCCs will provide three nominations for private sector representatives from each of the CT nations to participate in the Business Advisory Council.
- These nominations will be submitted to the Regional CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat in September 2015.
- All technical support partners offered support to the establishment of the BAC.
- The nominees are expected to be announced officially in 11th CTI-CFF SOM.

#### Discussions also generated *recommendations* that:

- It will be important to ensure clear benefits are articulated in order to generate interest and enthusiasm for private sector participation in the council.
- Nominations of private sector representatives should meet specific criteria (as previously discussed and outlined in BAC correspondence prior to the meeting).
- The Regional Secretariat may learn from similar regional organizations that have business advisory council institutions.
- There needs to be a clear mechanism for technical support partners to assist the CT6 private sector representatives in acquiring the necessary information for joining and actively participating in the BAC.
- Whilst the current forum is focusing on sustainable tourism as a business sector within the Coral Triangle, the BAC was originally envisaged to be multi-sectoral, and should therefore have wider private sector representation beyond tourism (i.e. shipping, offshore mining and other marine related business sectors).
- The NCCs of each country may send letters to partners to ascertain further input BAC matters.
- Partners are welcome to support the facilitation and preparations for the BAC nominations in September in collaboration with the CT6 NCCs.



"Core to our needs is a marketplace of ideas with a built-in call-toaction potential that reaches all corners of the globe. Instead of depending on individual callings and an overnight dream to be a dogooder, a clear regional prioritization and roadmap should be our focus and impetus for organizing."

Astrid Sri Haryati, CEO, Terra Lumen Indonesia. (Jakarta Post)<sup>4</sup>

#### The EXPO

The Expo ran throughout the conference, and hosted 14 booths representing a range of marine diving, conservation and governmental institutions. Participants and visitors engaged with sustainable marine tourism industry representatives with the aim to create a market platform and establish linkages that allow key business and industry players to promote their product /services within the Coral Triangle. Exhibiting companies were present from all six Coral Triangle countries, and included dive resorts / operators, liveaboard / cruise operators, hotels and coastal resorts, and other industries related to the marine tourism sectors, along with government representatives from all six nations.



<sup>4</sup> The Coral, Fish and Food. Opinion. The Jakarta Post. Sunday, August 30<sup>th</sup>, 2015.

#### **Investment Forum**

Hosted by the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia, Directorate General of Marine, Coastal, and Small Islands Affairs (DG-MCSIA), Directorate of Small Islands Management and Directorate for Conservation of Areas and Fish Species, this session was attended by 95 participants, from the private marine tourism sector, government investment and planning agencies from across the Coral Triangle, and NGO technical support partners.

This invite only session was opened by Dr. Sudirman Saad, Director Generale of Coastal, Marine and Small Islands, Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries. The session included an introduction to investors guidelines (providing information on the relevant policies, rules and regulations about investing in small islands, coastal and conservation areas in Indonesia); and showcased a range of success stories of current investment projects.

This Investment Forum focused on the sustainable development of small islands and conservation areas through the marine tourism industry in the coral triangle area, including the showcasing of ten pre-identified islands offering attractive investment opportunities. The session included presentation and discussion from the Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC), Mr. Luigi Cabrini, generating considerable discussion regarding criteria setting and vetting of investment proposals through the region. The forum served as a platform to build on existing successful investment, as well as to launch the future partnerships, to advance the sustainable development of small islands, coastal and conservation areas in the six nations of the coral triangle.

The forum speakers were: Mr. Noor Fuad Fitrianto [Directorate of Investment Planning for Services and Economic Zone, the Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board]; Mr. HS. All Jabbar [Director of Coastal, Small Islands, Border and Specific Areas, Ministry of Agrarian and Spatial Affairs]; Major General TNI (Mar) Buyung Lalana (Mr.) [Indonesian Marine Corps Commandant, Indonesian Navy]; Mr. Luigi Cabrini [Chair, Global Sustainable Tourism Council]; Mr. Eko Sumbaryadi [Bupati of Kepulauan Anambas]; Mr. Talafudin [Secretary of Belitung Timur]; Mr. Zulkifli Adam [Mayor of Sabang]; Mr. Aba Maulaka [Head of Marine and Fisheries of Nusa Tenggara Timur Province]; Mr. Mukhlis R [Mayor of Pariaman]; Mr. Erzaldi Rosman [Head of Marine and Fisheries Bangka Tengah]; Mr. H. Jamal Malik [Bupati of Sumbawa]; Andreas Rentaubun [Bupati of Maluku Tenggara]; James Sumendap, SH [Bupati of Minahasa Tenggara].

### The Buyer-Sellers Meetings on Coral Triangle Dive Tourism

The Buyer-Seller Meetings event on Coral Triangle Dive Tourism was a networking opportunity connecting together the world's dive tourism market in the Coral Triangle area. The meetings were attended by 17 buyers and 24 sellers. As a travel mart this event enabled buyers and sellers of marine tourism in the Coral Triangle area to meet and explore business collaborations. The aim was for marine tourism operators in diverse lines of business, industry associations, chambers of commerce and trade promotion bodies to meet with potential investors and buyers not only from Coral Triangle area but also from other parts of the world. Potential collaborations, trades etc are now in the process of follow up between the individuals concerned and information on finalized arrangements will be gathered in 2016.

## **Special Events**

In addition to the wide ranging side events of this Fourth Regional Business Forum, a number of special events and field trips were also held.

## Signing of MOU: CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat and Coral Triangle Center

The fourth Regional Business Forum also witnessed the signing of an MOU between the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat and the Coral Triangle Center, to formalize relevant collaborative efforts in fostering capacity building and enhancing key stakeholders' participation in achieving CTI-CFF objectives and goals. The CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat is mandated to promote regional cooperation, sharing of lessons, and facilitate learning across the six Coral Triangle countries, as well as coordinate and monitor progress in achieving the CTI-CFF Regional Plan of Action goals. It also serves as the main liaison and for all CTI-CFF official functions such as the CTI-CFF Senior Officials Meetings and the CTI-CFF Ministerial Meetings. It is currently based at the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries in Jakarta, Indonesia. The Coral Triangle Center (CTC) is a regional learning center of excellence in tropical marine and coastal resources management. CTC is an independent foundation based in Bali, Indonesia with a regional scope in training marine resource managers and educates all groups that interact with coastlines and reefs within the Coral Triangle. The MOU signed between these two entities *recognizes* that:

- CTI-CFF and CTC share the Coral Triangle region as their geographic focus, and have a common mission and vision in protecting the most diverse, marine and coastal ecosystem for fisheries and food securities.
- All CT6 countries identified capacity building as one of the highest priorities in the regional and national plans of action to achieve the CTI-CFF goals.

Acknowledging that the CTI-CFF has endorsed CTC as development partner at 5th CTI-CFF Ministerial Meeting in Manado on May 2014, and taking into consideration the relevant functions of CTC and CTI-CFF, this general MOU focuses on the following aspects:

- Assessment and facilitation of training and learning needs with the Technical Working Groups (TWGs) to achieve the Regional Plan of Action (RPoA), with focus on the delivery of practical trainings, workshops and learning exchanges at the regional and national levels.
- Support to Marine Protected Areas (MPA), the MPA learning network, and the development of a Coral Triangle- wide Portfolio of MPA Learning Sites.
- Support to cross-cutting initiatives engaging key stakeholders in achieving the goals of the RPoA including:
  - The CTI-CFF Women Leaders Forum
  - The CTI-CFF Local Government Network
  - The Regional Business Forum
  - The Coral Triangle Day outreach activities



#### **Gala Dinner**

On the evening of day one of the event, participants enjoyed a Gala Dinner, where there were performances of music and dance from some of the leading artists from Bali and Wakatobi, as well as a range of celebratory events. This included the launch of a new and insightful book presented by Mr. Eko Rudianto, called 'Unlocking the stories behind the CTI-CFF' produced by the interim CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat within MMAF, providing a compilation of interviews and extracts from working groups meetings, SOMs and Ministerial Meetings, as well as insights from behind the scenes of the processes undertaken in achieving the Coral Triangle Initiative.

The dinner also saw the showcasing of the most detailed dive site book ever produced in the region, The 'Indonesia Dive Directory', published by Scuba Diver Australasia, and led by Mr. Cipto Gunawan, with contributions from a wide range of regional dive experts. This showcasing activity was accompanied by Ms. Dive Indonesia beauty contest winner of 2014. Other organizations supporting the goals of the CTI-CFF were recognized, and a splendid four course meal was enjoyed by all.

Also at the Gala Dinner some of the leading lights from the private sector were awarded for their contributions to sustainable marine and coastal tourism in the coral triangle. These were:

• Reef Seen Divers' Resort, Pemuteran, Bali, Indonesia – operating since 1991 this dive resorts owner, Chris Brown, responded when he saw the reefs of Pemuteran reach a critical state, damaged by dynamite fishing, the aquarium and live reef fish trades, and initiated a three pronged program: (i) the Reef Gardeners project - which trains and creates jobs for young fishers to actively protect the coral reefs; (ii) the turtle project - where the resort buys green, olive ridley and hawksbill turtle eggs and turtles caught in nets from local fishers, hatches and releases them; and (ii) the promotion of Balinese traditional dancing by collaborating with the children of Pemuteran to carry on this beautiful tradition. Hosted at the dive resort these children have a chance to also learn about the marine environment around then, and dance performances shown twice a week raise funds to support the children's families and the local dance school.



"I acknowledge the visionaries and leaders who have paved the way
for sustainable marine tourism in the region, and I hope
more will follow in your footsteps."

Ambassador Robert Blake, U.S. Embassy Jakarta, Indonesia
(Jakarta Globe)<sup>5</sup>

- Scuba Junkie, Mabul, Sabah, Malaysia runs a 'Supporter Engagement' project, which is tailored to staff and local communities. These include presentations and talks on sharks, turtles, marine debris and dynamite fishing, designed to inspire local people about their surroundings and encourage them to take pride and care of their own environments. Scuba Junkie specifically targets local children in their awareness raising activities and they conducts tailored workshops which meet curricular criteria in two local schools. They also work with the stateless children in the nearby village on Mabul, children who would otherwise not receive formal education or learn about the environment upon which they rely for everything. With the support of the Sabah Wildlife Department and the District Officer of Semporna, they set up Mabul Island's first and only Marine Turtle Hatchery, to ensure eggs are monitored and protected until they are safely released into the sea. They also conduct weekly beach clean ups with their guests, and their ecofriendly Mabul Beach Resort has been developed so that it has minimal negative impact on the local environment and communities of Mabul.
- Madang Resort Hotel, Madang, Papua New Guinea promotes sustainable management of natural resources throughout Papua New Guinea with their operation of the Melanesian Tourist Services providing as well as promoting, community based tourism, hospitality services and tours around Madang Province, the Sepik river, and around Bismarck Sea Provinces in PNG. Madang Resort Hotel is currently known as the most popular tourist destination in PNG. The hotel promotes packages with a range of destination options, taking guests to local sites/villages, the atolls, the beautiful snorkeling sites, and bird watching, to name a few. The company promotes sustainable management of marine and forest resources by the local communities to foster community tourism as a sustainable development agenda. Most of all it promotes connections with local resource owners and community tourism operators and makes the link to promote tourism to local and rural communities so that tourists enjoy the natural beauty of the environment in Madang and PNG.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Forum applauds conservation efforts: Jakarta Globe. Basten Gokken. 01 September, 2015

- Evolution Diving, Malapascua, Cebu, Philippines has incorporated the concept of sustainability into the core of their business operations through the establishment of the Malapascua Marine Protection Fund, developed to offset the lack of resources available from the local government to address local environmental issues. This fund is paid into by their customers and has expanded to accept donations from almost all other dive and tourism related operations on the island. It now funds: three patrol boats and 14 sea wardens to patrol local marine protected areas in the region; the installation and maintenance of mooring buoys to reduce anchor damage; the installation of lines to indicate viewing areas and reduce diver impact; and the organization of mass clean-up efforts (labor and boats provided). In addition to this the dive company operates with sustainability principles (no plastics etc), and raises awareness on marine conservation issues. Following typhoon Haiyan Evolution was also able to mobilize the rebuilding of over 100 family homes, contributed food, medicine and water to hundreds of people in the weeks after the storm, supported the rebuilding of the Elementary school, and provided flushing eco-friendly toilets to >500 people in the region.
- Oravae Cottage, Gizo, Solomon Islands has been operating for almost 20 years and is a registered ecolodge international accreditation and is an active member of several local community and national marine conservation committees, including the Gizo Marine Conservation Council and the Solomon Island Visitors Bureau. With three tourist cottages available, their main focus has been to protect the marine environment while operating as a tourism business through the establishment of a Locally Managed Marine Area (LLMA) around their premises, where there is no fishing or extraction is permitted. The LMMA is enforced through community based rangers, and they have recently been part of a national government initiative working with WWF to establish a formal Marine Protected Area at the site (to allow them the legal rights to protect the area). They also promote coral and clam farming, as a means to increase marine biodiversity, provide awareness talks at their resort and to neighboring village, and hold regular dialogues with the local communities in developing more sustainable and environmental farming, forestry and agricultural practices. They support the local economy by buying local food and also work hard to source food that is grown sustainably, and with best environmental practices, and he Oravae ecolodge relies on solar power and tank water to ensure minimal environmental impact. They provide employment opportunities and teach both their staff and local school children and community members about the value of protecting the marine environment.
- Dive Timor Lorosae, Dili, Timor-Leste was established in 2002 as one of the first dive shops in Timor-Leste. Since then, the company has grown into a PADI 5 Star Instructor Development Center offering various technical and professional training while striving to set up and maintain a high standard for scuba diving, training and tourism. The company collaborates with local organizations to organize regular beach clean ups and raise awareness about marine debris. Dive Timor Lorosae also works with conservation organizations, such as Conservation International and NOAA, to help in underwater scientific expeditions and monitoring. As one of the few dive shops in the country, the business provides employment to Timorese community members and helps raise their awareness about the importance of sustaining and protecting marine life for future generations.

"Businesses in marine and coastal tourism in the Coral Triangle must receive adequate attention and commitment from all related stakeholders: governments, private sector, academia and communities."

Eko Rudianto, Director of Coastal and Marine, MMAF (Jakarta Globe)<sup>6</sup>

These six businesses were chosen from 12 nominees submitted by various CTI-CFF Partners across the region. All nominees were reviewed and scored by seven judges representing CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat and organizers of the 4th CTI-CFF Regional Business Forum, according to the following criteria. The enterprise must:

- 1. Actively support the conservation of coastal areas, marine habitats, and marine wildlife
- 2. Engages local government and empowers communities regarding planning and decision making about sustainable marine tourism in their areas
- 3. Supports local enterprises to promote and develop sustainable products under fair trade principles. These products may include food and beverages, crafts, agricultural products, etc.
- 4. Improves the quality of life in local communities by providing social, economic, and other opportunities
- 5. Provides training for staff and communities to raise awareness of the special qualities and sensitivities of the local natural and cultural heritage
- 6. Utilizes energy efficient technologies and innovative means to reduce waste generation, therefore minimizing any negative impacts on the natural environment.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Forum applauds conservation efforts: Jakarta Globe. Basten Gokken. 01 September, 2015

\_\_\_

#### Visit to Kima Gardens

On the morning of day two of the event, several participants gathered at the nearby Kima Gardens, where giant clams are being re-introduced to Bengiat Beach, an area of coastline in Nusa Dua. This re-introduction has been initiated and supported by private tourism businesses, community groups and NGOs. It has been established to counter the downward spiral of giant clams in the region. The marine garden is being set up in an area that was historically famous for clam populations that were previously decimated by over-extraction. The initiative was launched by Director General for Marine, Coasts and Small Islands of the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, Indonesia, Dr.Sudirman Saad, in Bengiat Nusa Dua Beach. The area of coastline being utilized has been zoned for artificial hexadome shaped reef structures to be placed, at a suitable location to promote clam settlement and sustainability. As a first step 22 artificial reefs have been placed in the Coral and Kima Garden area, at a depth of 3-5 meters. A total of 330 juveniles of species the clams *Tridacna derasa*, *Tridacna hipopus hippopus* and *Tridacna squamosa* were connected to the above mentioned artificial structure. These juvenile clams were imported from the clam aquaculture center of the Faculty of Fisheries and Marine Sciences, Hasanuddin University and PT. Dinar Darum Lestari. The next step of the program is to further connect 1000 juveniles per year of seven different clam species at the Kima Garden.

Kima Garden will be managed on-site by the Community Surveillance Group (Pokmaswas) of Yasa Segara Bengiat, in collaboration with the Nusa Dua Reef Foundation (NDRF), supported by the Center for Management of Coastal Resources and Marine (BPSPL) Denpasar DG KP3K Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries, as well as the School of Marine Science and Fisheries, Universitas Hasanuddin (UNHAS). Through this activity this area is to be promoted as a sustainable maritime tourism destination in Nusa Dua.

"Kima gardens is designed to be a clam conservation-based ecotourism attraction, combined with coral reef rehabilitation program by restocking the area to promote the development of a wild population" Dr. Sudirman Saad, Director General of Marine, Coastal and Small Islands Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries (AntaraBali)<sup>7</sup>



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Antara News - I Gusti Bagus Widyantara, Keberadaan Kima Perlu Dilestarikan, 28 Agustus, http://www.antarabali.com/berita/77305/keberadaan-kima-perlu-dilestarikan

#### Visit to Nusa Penida MPA

Participants to the conference also had the opportunity to visit Nusa Penida Marine Protected Area. Twenty-one (21) participants joined the field trip, the objectives of which were:

- to share with RBF participants the experiences and programs of the CTC learning site in Nusa Penida related to MPA establishment processes and its zoning system, stakeholders engagement, and marine tourism management; and
- to facilitate informal discussion between participants with representative of the MPA management unit and community related community conservation action and marine eco-tourism.

The field trip included a speed boat transport to & from the MPA (located just off the coast of Sanur Bali); a mangrove tour conducted by a local ecotourism community group; a seaweed farming tour and visit to a mangrove seed bank established by community members; as well as the optional activities of either (i) snorkeling over the beautiful reefs of the MPA, or (ii) viewing coral transplantation activities. The field trip also included discussions with the management unit of the MPA. During these discussions the process of MPA design, development and establishing (from initiation to management unit establishment) was outlined; issues surrounding community engagement were explored, with the Unit managers walking participants through the extensive community engagement activities that have been on-going since inception of the project, and which have shaped the development of the MPA as it stands today; the processes in place for the acquisition of scientific data for management decision making were outlined; examples of mangrove rehabilitation successes were shared; and the challenges of regulating tourism numbers were discussed.

This field trip was led by: Marthen Welly, Wira Sanjaya, Erdi Lazuardi, Jenny Karmy, Dana Cook and Jerica Rossi [CTC]. Participants of the trip were: Mr. Bartholomew Parapolo [Minister of Tourism - Solomon Islands], Mr. Greg Auta'a [Tourism Principal Officer], Ms. Merry Budihardja [LO for Solomon Islands], Ms. Diana Divalotu [Ministry of Fisheries & Forest – Fiji], Ms. Amelia Moore [University of Rhode Island], Ms. Chiara Zuccarino [NOAA], Ms. Nicole Coombe [Dept. Of Environment Australia], Mr. Vincent Hilomen [ADB], Mr. Morales Guillermo [ADB], Mr. Arwandrija Rukma [CTI-CFF], Ms. Kimberly Chung [WWF], Mr. Luigi Cabrini [GSTC], Mr. Marc Weitzel [USDOI], Mrs. Marc Weitzel [USDOI-Spouse], Ms. Weitzel [USDOI-Dependent], Mr. Chris Brown [Reef Seen Divers], Mr. Patson Baea [Oravae Cottage], Mr. Francisco Mesina [Dive Timor Lorosae], Ms. Mary Cody [US-DOI], Ms. Krystyna [ID Guides], and Mr. Sofwan [ID Guides].



### **Learning Cocktail Reception**

This reception took place following the field trip, and enabled participants to share ideas and feedback for 'sustaining' sustainable marine tourism in Nusa Penida MPA. Reflection discussions were held on sustainable marine tourism standards, navigating new emerging markets for marine tourism, and adding value to the existing Nusa Penida community mangrove tour. At the reception participants were divided into three groups to deep dive into particular issues.

**Group 1** - explored the how to develop codes of conduct and how to we make sure any such codes of conduct could be implemented. *Consensus* was reached that it was important to develop codes of conduct for sustainable tourism across the coral triangle that could be implemented at all sites, including Nusa Penida MPA. It was *recommended* that:

- It was not necessary to develop a new code of conduct, but rather build on existing ones and tailor accordingly to CT relevant issues.
- The Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries in collaboration to Ministry of Tourism Indonesia are encouraged to compile existing guidelines and make assessments and recommendations for tailoring.
- Codes of conduct should be accompanied by associated regulations, to ensure compliance and promote enforcement of the codes.
- The CTI-CFF should be encouraged to become the implementing body of the marine tourism code of conduct across Coral Triangle countries. This will require collaboration amongst the ministries of the six CT nations to ensure implementation.
- Any codes of conduct need accompanying materials, in clear laymans language, to help tourism
  operators and local communities understand and interpret them appropriately. Site specific elements
  should also be included (such as a code of conduct for mola mola encounters in Nusa Penida MPA).

This group was moderated by: Denny Boy Mochran and I Nyoman Suardana [CTC]. Participants were: Luigi Cabriani [GSCT], Chris Brown [Reef Seen], Fransisco Mesina [Dive Timor Lorosae], Arwan Rukma [CTI Regional Secretariat], Vincent Hilomen [DENR-Philippines] Wira Sanjaya [CTC].

"Francis Lee, President of Singaporean resort Raffles Marine who was among the forum speakers, said that the adoption of standards for investment would not only boost efforts to conserve marine resources, but also create shared values." (Jakarta Globe)<sup>8</sup>

**Group 2** - explored how to navigate the new emerging market (of Mass tourism)? What are the risks? What are the solutions? The facilitator set the scene by explaining about the new emerging markets visiting the CT nations, such as tourists from China and other Asian countries, tend to come in large groups, and whilst they visit wilderness locations, they rarely engage with nature, and can increase negative environmental impacts in certain areas. From the discussions *consensus* was reached that:

- Mass tourism is inevitable, and one of the main revenue generators for the tourism industry.
- Key risks emerge from this sector however, such as (i) changing landscapes due to high visitation numbers of tourists; (ii) traffic congestion resulting from increased buses and road traffic in an area; (iii) ethical issues such as cultural sensitivity; and (iv) pollution and environmental degradation (including ballast water pollution from cruise ships).

 $<sup>^8</sup>$  Sustainable tourism seen as key to Coral Triangle Conservation. Jakarta Globe. Baston Gokkson. 01 September, 2015

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- Planning for environmentally aware, ethical, and responsible tourism designs from the outset is critical, as the plans can incorporate the control and management of mass tourism influx, and provide the necessary mitigation measures to offset environmental and cultural risks
- Pricing strategy is critical (including visitor fees, permits, or visa prices). Increasing the cost of visiting an area is one of tools utilized to filter tourist and encourage high yield (financially) and low impact (environmentally and culturally) tourist markets.
- Increasing visa prices for countries where mass tourists are coming from will also provide a filter effect.
- Temporal and spatial zoning strategies are important to limit the number of visitors at any one site in any one time. Zoning restriction strategies include (for example) the closing of an area for tourism activity for a period of time annually.
- Implementing a fining system for tourists (in line with the code of conduct expectations discussed in group 1) is also a strategy for mitigating, or ensuring compensation for negative impacts from mass tourism sectors. However, such an approach requires well-run regulations with strong law enforcement.
- It is important to determine and regulate for an appropriate carrying capacity of tourists in any given area. Such capacity can be incorporated into the codes of conduct for entering an area, and / or can provide limitations to an area.
- Limitations can also be imposed in terms of tourism operators approved to work in a given area. For example, only those with appropriate eco certifications could be approved to operate in certain areas, to ensure all business operations are conducted in an appropriately environmentally friendly way.
- It is important to promote locally owned businesses to keep mass tourist dollars that are entering the economy within the region / location of focus, and to ensure maximal community and local benefits (for those who are providing the relevant goods and services of an area) and minimize economic leakage.
- Ensure regular assessments are undertaken of any mass tourist activities / sites to ensure local managers can respond accordingly to risks as they arise.
- Develop specific tour packages that can accommodate mass tourists but also mitigate impact. For example, marketing experiences that cater to the 'selfie culture', or photography classes in nature.

This group was moderated by: Adityo Setiawan and Hesti Widodo [CTC]. Participants were: Chiara Zuccarino-Crowe [NOAA], Amelia Moore [University of Rhode Island], Mary Cody [US-Bureau of Ocean Energy Environment], and a representative from WWF Malaysia.



**Group 3** – discussed the potential for adding value to the community mangrove tour on Nusa Penida that the participants had visited earlier that day. Through discussions consensus was reached that:

- The tour did not have sufficient information provided to the visitor from the guide.
- English language limitations on the part of the guides is a barrier to effective communication during the tour.

#### Key *recommendations* were:

- To provide English language training to the guides.
- To ensure the tour includes personalized stories that participants will value, such as the connection of
  the mangrove with the local people's lives, the importance of the mangrove to the local culture, and the
  importance of the ecosystem to its inhabitants and people.
- Guides could provide the visitor with a briefing of the tour before departure (providing information on tour duration and associated basic information), so that guests know what to expect.
- Additionally / alternatively a video could be developed that could be played to visitors.
- During the tour it is good to have a special place where the boat can rest temporarily while information is provided to guests. This would avoid the guide having to overcome the sound of the engine while the boat is running. This briefing area could be equipped with signage and information.
- Guides need to be recruited that have easy going personalities and are comfortable to interact with many types of visitors. To support both recruitment and training, a professional guide could be brought on board to mentor the local guide(s) for some time.

This group was moderated by: Kristina Khyrsyakova [ID guides] and Siti Syahwali [CTC]. Participants were: Pak Bam Parablo [Minister of Tourism from Solomon Islands], a representative from Fiji and Emong Morales [ADB, Phillippines]

### Feedback and Assessment

At the end of the event an evaluation form was circulated to participants to actively seek feedback and assessment of the event, and all its component parts. Participants were asked for each component, whether it was (i) below expectation, (ii) met expectation, or (iii) exceeded expectation. The **Roundtables** received a positive reception from participants, with 37% of participants considering that they exceeded expectations and 61% considering they met expectation. For the **Panel Plenary Sessions** 23% of the audience felt they exceeded expectations, with 65% considering they met expectations. For the ten **Open Sessions** that were held, overall scoring showed that 31% of participants felt they exceeded expectations, whilst 60% felt they met expectations. Finally the **logistics** were highly lauded through this event. With 67% of participants considering the venue to have exceeded expectation, 63% considering the hotel and accommodation to have exceeded expectation, and 54% considering the food and beverage provided to have exceeded expectation.

### **Media Coverage**

The fourth Regional Business Forum generated considerable media coverage, including six English language press articles and 37 Bahasa Indonesian press mentions/articles. The media covered a range of topics explored during the event, and all highlighted the need for the adoption of codes of conduct and sustainable standards in marine tourism development in the Coral Triangle.

### **Conclusions and Next Steps**

As this report shows, a wide range of consensus areas and recommendations resulted from the event. These recommendations were targeted towards a wide range of sectors involved in sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

Some recommendations are particularly targeted at specific sectors / organizations / sites. For example, the recommendations emerging from the learning cocktail event are particularly targeted towards the continued advancement and strengthening of ecotourism in Nusa Penida MPA; the Womens Leaders Roundtable outputs are particularly targeted towards emerging women professionals in the arena of sustainability; and the LGN recommendations are particularly targeted towards future LGN development (please see those sections for more information).

For all sectors there was a recommendation for the establishment of a Business Advisory Council, that may continue to coordinate collaboration between private sector marine tourism representatives, government agencies, NGOs and local community representatives from across the Coral Triangle.

"We need to strengthen and enhance our partnership to ensure that the coral triangle region can be a model of ecosystem based sustainable (resources) management." Dr. Sudirman Saad, DG KP3K (INDOPOS)9

# Recommendations for Private Sector Tourism Operators, Investors and Local Communities

Key recommendations were particularly identified for consideration and promotion by private sector tourism operators and investors directly, as well as communities being engaged, or engaging in, sustainable marine tourism activities. These recommendations will be shared explicitly with all relevant private sector and associated community groups across the CT region (i.e. with tourism associations in all six nations, investment groups and key influencers in the private sector, and community based networks) for wide dissemination amongst their stakeholders.

In no particular order, private sector actors and local communities have been recommended to:

# 1. Engage in the development and implementation of sustainable tourism guidelines for the Coral Triangle.

The development of sustainable marine tourism guidelines for the Coral Triangle was a recommendation that repeatedly emerged through the discussions and forum of the event. Concurrent with this was the recognition that it will be essential to engage and involve representatives of the marine tourism private sector, as well as community representatives, in the design and development of these guidelines. In addition to this, it was noted that guideline implementation expectations need to be appropriately graded to enable wide ranging private sector and community actors to implement them over time (with associated capacity building and technical support if / where required), and in consideration of resource availability.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Translated from INDOPOS, Terumbu Karang Potensi Destinasi Bahari Dunia, 28 August 2015

## 2. Engage in certification programs where possible / relevant, and ensure operational standards meet the level required to achieve relevant sustainable tourism certification of investments and operations.

Private sector actors and communities active in marine tourism activities are encouraged to participate in certification programs where possible / relevant. Engaging in certification schemes has been found to support both conservation causes and business operations, promote effective branding of product, and ensure sustainability principles are incorporated through all elements of operations.

# 3. Support the development of a clear business case that can be used in communications and promotions for other investors and operators to proactively embrace sustainability principles.

Throughout the forum the issue was raised that there is a need for a clear business case to be made, to help investors understand the positive opportunities that sustainable tourism approaches can provide, and promote engagement in sustainable activities. It is therefore recommended that private sector actors and community members with experiences in this area collaborate with government partners and technical support agencies to develop such case(s) for wide dissemination throughout the Coral Triangle, to show that sustainable operations do not impede, and can indeed promote, enhanced profitability.

# 4. Ensure the involvement of local communities (if private sector) and / or engage proactively in investment activities (if communities) in tourism operations.

The importance of involving and engaging local communities in sustainable marine tourism operations was repeatedly highlighted throughout the forum. For private sector investors and actors it was noted as critical to be respectful to local communities and ensure their involvement and inclusivity in decision making processes. 'Local people are the curators of their own place-based authenticity', and successful sustainable tourism recognizes and maintains local cultures, and utilizes elements as part of the tourist experience. For community members, it was noted that proactive entrepreneurship and ownership maximizes economic benefits and reduces economic leakage from local communities. Actors can seek training and support to equip them with the tools necessary to identify the marketable factors of site based areas, and the platforms to develop and manage their own enterprises, stories and messages as part of a branding process.

# 5. Engage and be involved in the upcoming efforts to develop effective 'branding and marketing' for key marine destinations in the Coral Triangle.

Any branding and marketing efforts need to involve leaders of the private sector, as well as local businesses and local community representatives, in order to ensure marketable assets of a destination are identified and inventoried appropriately, and branding and marketing captures appropriately the anticipated visitor experience. Branding also needs to be tied into existing national tourism associations, and it will be important to ensure strong partnerships between the business and government sectors for brand promotion. The private sectors expertise in understanding target markets and demographics of focus will also be critical in any branding and marketing efforts.

## 6. Promote and ensure there is effective coordination between private sector associations involved in sustainability issues.

Private sector actors need to take lead responsibility for ensuring there is coordination and cooperation between existing private sector institutions (i.e. tourism associations, chambers of commerce etc), as well between private and public sectors on sustaining business and development.

#### 7. Lead by example, and ensure all operations follow best practice principles for sustainable tourism.

During the forum it was noted as imperative for industry leaders to 'lead by example', exemplifying best practice sustainability principles, good governance, long term engagement with and investment in local communities, transparent corporate social responsibility, and positive engagement in marine and coastal management and conservation.

"It is our responsibility to sustain our waters. All thoughts presented, solutions implemented, and actions taken, will be a huge contribution towards our long term investment for our future generations,"

Asep Djebar, Secretary of the Coordinating Ministry of Marine and Resources Affairs (INDOPOS)<sup>10</sup>

### **Recommendations for Policy Makers and Regulatory Decision Makers**

Other recommendations pertain to policy makers and regulatory decision makers in the CT region. These recommendations will be compiled and presented at the upcoming CTI-CFF senior officials meeting (SOM) meeting in November, with associated support information to support the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat to formalize these recommendations into clear policy related promotion for all CT6 countries. This will also include the identification of areas where more follow up work is required.

The CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, Coral Triangle governmental agencies, policy makers and decision makers are, in no particular order, recommended to:

# 1. Coordinate and officiate the development of guidelines for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

The development of sustainable marine tourism guidelines for the Coral Triangle was a recommendation that repeatedly emerged through the discussions and forum of the event. Throughout discussions it was noted that these guidelines may largely be built upon existing globally available guidelines, but with some tailored components specific to Coral Triangle conditions. The guidelines should be relevant to all potential tourism related sectors, and accessible by all (i.e. available in a range of languages and in non-technical language). Any codes of conduct or guidelines developed should be accompanied by associated regulations, to ensure compliance and promote enforcement of the codes. It was also noted that certain areas / sites will have specific needs which will require specific codes of conduct (adjusted to local needs). Any implementation of region wide guidelines will also require collaboration amongst the ministries of the six CT nations.

# 2. Promote existing, and / or new (where relevant) sustainable marine tourism certification programs in line with the aforementioned guidelines.

Certification has been recognized to help tourists identify where they should be giving their business, reward businesses by bringing in business from consumers who value ecological and cultural sustainability, and also helps operators become exceptional sustainable businesses. Government agencies can promote the adoption of certification programs through the provision of associated incentives (for example, in Australia, tourism businesses with sustainability certification can acquire a 15 year permit for operations, whereas those without certification may only acquire a 3 year permit). The governments of CT nations are encouraged to explore what incentive mechanisms may be promoted to encourage wider certification, and associated enhances, to the sustainability of existing and new tourism investments.

Engage in, and support, the branding and marketing of key destinations in the Coral Triangle, with the
recognition that destination branding may not adhere to administrative boundaries or limitations, and
support the necessary coordination across administrative boundaries to facilitate effective destination
marketing.

It is noted that destinations identified for promotion through branding and marketing are unlikely to adhere to administrative boundaries, and government agencies across administrations are encouraged to collaborate and cooperate to ensure effective cross-institutional coordination and promotion of the destination.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Translated from INDOPOS, Terumbu Karang Potensi Destinasi Bahari Dunia 28 August 2015.

4. Ensure appropriate regulatory and investment related provision of incentives, and identify and remove any associated regulatory or investment related disincentives, to promote sustainable marine tourism investment in the Coral Triangle.

Governments of the CT6 nations have a critical role to play in promoting and supporting companies that are making efforts to undertake sustainable practices and conservation support in their areas, and / or undertaking CSR to support the marine and coastal environment and associated communities across the region. It was noted during the forum that appropriate incentives need to be provided to the private sector and disincentives removed - to encourage investment in sustainable tourism.

# 5. To enable the development of clear investment and development processes for sustainable tourism in and adjacent to marine protected areas.

During the forum it was recommended that government agencies related to MPAs coordinate the development of a 'one-stop-shop' for sustainable marine tourism investors at each site (those who meet the pre-defined criteria for investment). This would provide considerable streamlining and incentives for sustainable marine tourism investors to promote appropriate tourism activities in areas of high conservation value. Any one-stop-shop should be accompanied by appropriate data on carrying capacity of the site, limitations to ensure are in place, and any additional sustainability criteria beyond the region wide guidelines that are relevant to that particular site.

6. Further explore and promote the development of financing mechanisms in collaboration with private sector partners, to support the achievement of the goals of the CTI-CFF. Mechanisms to explore include: the establishment of a regional challenge fund; the development of special eco-economic zones; the development of impact investment models; the establishment of collaborative user-fee systems in MPAs; the promotion of direct engagement businesses where private operators directly contribute to marine and coastal management support.

A range of financing mechanisms that could be supported by the private sector to achieve the goals of the CTI-CFF were identified through the forum. The establishment of a regional challenge fund, akin to the 'Caribbean Challenge Initiative' (CCI) and 'Micronesia Challenge', to incentivize/match commitments from both government and private sector investors was one suggested mechanism. The potential designation of well-planned Special Eco-Economic Zones (SEEZs), to attract private sector funding to specific places and connect funding to the needs identified in CTI-CFF plans of action was another mechanism to explore. In addition to these, exploration into 'impact investment models' was recommended, including examples where corporations' pool funding for low or zero interest loans for capital investments. It was also noted that MPAs could generate revenue on-site through the establishment of user fee systems that could be developed in collaboration with private sector partners at the sites.

7. Establish clear and transparent systems to ensure financing and management mechanisms uphold to the highest levels of integrity, accountability and good governance.

Throughout the forum it was noted that good governance and transparency are key to ensuring trust between different sectors. The private sector have an important role to play in influencing and ensuring accountability and continuity of commitments from Heads of State facing turnovers in government and associated staffing, and the government agencies have a critical role to play in ensuring systems are established that uphold the highest levels of integrity, accountability and good governance.

8. Ensure there is consistency and coordination between all relevant governmental agencies and institutions in promoting sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

Whilst guidelines and measures may be promoted at the CT regional level, there needs to be consistency, coordination and enforcement of government regulations at a range of levels (central, local, district government, etc.). Central and local governments need to align systems in order to promote appropriate sustainable private sector engagement; for example aligning marine spatial planning with development goals, and ensuring clarity for investors entering an area. And there needs to be standardization of a

framework for the private sector to work effectively with governments and communities. It was noted that conflicting or inconsistent policies and regulation across geographic or political zones are an obstacle to implementation, therefore these obstacles need to be identified and removed.

"Businesses.. urged the governments of the six nations involved to work with the private sector and offer appropriate incentives – or remove disincentives – to encourage them to utilize sustainability principles." Baston Gokkson, Correspondent (Jakarta Globe)<sup>11</sup>

### **Recommendations for Technical Support Institutions**

Other recommendations are relevant for particular technical bodies within CT6 government agencies, and associated technical and capacity related support institutions (NGOs, Universities etc), to provide the necessary follow up support services to effectively assist the effective implementation of the policy areas being promoted above, as well as support private sector and community actors in achieving their goals. These recommendations will be disseminated widely to all technical support and associated institutions in the Coral Triangle.

In no particular order, technical support partners, NGOs, academic and associated institutions are recommended to:

1. Provide technical support to the development of guidelines for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

The guidelines mentioned in previous sections will requirement strong technical research and input for development that may be supported and facilitated by relevant technical support institutions.

2. Provide research and technical support for the promotion of existing, and / or new sustainable marine tourism certification initiative(s) to promote sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

Any certification process and program will require assessment and verification that may be supported by a range of technical support institutions in collaboration with certification institutions.

3. Provide capacity building support to relevant private sector actors, community groups and governmental agencies to promote a strong understanding of all elements related to sustainable marine tourism design, development, implementation and management (in accordance with associated guidelines developed).

Information, capacity building and technical support needs to be available to all sectors to deepen understanding of sustainable tourism practices across all sectors through the CT. Technical support institutions have a critical role to play in these capacity building efforts, and a range of capacity building tools should be utilized, tailored to the differing sectors. Countries across the CT are at different stages of sustainable tourism development and implementation, therefore ensuring capacity support to targeted areas will need to also be a part of a 'destination strategy' related to emerging branding and marketing efforts across the region.

4. Provide technical support to the development of a branding and marketing initiative for key destinations in the Coral Triangle.

The branding and marketing initiative proposed through the forum is anticipated to require a range of technical input in collaboration with government agencies and representatives from both the private sector and local communities. This is likely include: identifying and articulating the values and vision underpinning

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Sustainable tourism seen as key to Coral Triangle Conservation. Jakarta Globe. Baston Gokkson. 01 September, 2015

the CT brand; the potential organizational structure for branding and marketing efforts (learning from similar examples in the Caribbean and ASEAN nations); articulating the primary purpose of the brand; incorporating the agreed criteria into destination selection; developing an appropriate 'destination strategy'; identifying sites; identifying target markets and sectors; provision of related branding and marketing materials (images, videos etc).

5. Provide research and collaborative technical support to the development of a clear business case that can be used in communications and promotions for investors and operators to proactively embrace sustainability principles.

As mentioned previously, a credible business case needs to be developed and articulated to promote private sector engagement, providing sound financial justification for supporting the CTI-CFF goals, whilst recognizing private sector benefits may vary between different sectors. Technical support institutions have a role to play in collaboration with private sector partners and government agencies, in the development of these businesses case(s) for wide dissemination.

Provide technical support to governmental agencies and associated private sector actors and communities in identifying future potential business opportunities for sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

Technical support for this work may take a range of forms, from mapping business opportunities in marine tourism across the Coral Triangle, to providing private sector linkages for targeted engagement in particular areas.

7. Promote the advancement of 'voluntourism' engagement across the region, to support sustainable marine tourism related operations, sites and visitor experiences.

It was recognized through the forum that it is advantageous to expand/ implement voluntourism programs in MPAs and other areas of high conservation value, thus capitalizing on the skills coming into an area, as well as the financial support such approaches can provide. Technical support institutions can provide global reach, access and opportunities to encourage voluntourism at select sites.

8. Undertake associated research activities where desired / required to support sustainable marine tourism in the Coral Triangle.

A range of additional research needs are anticipated to arise as the CT nations progress down the road of promoting and advancing sustainable marine tourism across the region. Research may include (for example), having carrying capacity studies available for an area; analyzing where and how benefits are produced that can shape investment decisions; mapping of marine ecosystem values for business case future developments; and the monitoring and evaluation of sustainable marine tourism promotion across the region.

"The government needs to set a standard of carrying capacity of each marine tourism destination. We can't have our districts boost the number of tourist in a way that results in the degradation of the environment. We need to have a balance between utilization for economic benefit and conservation."

Safri Burhanuddin, Deputy for HR coordination, Science and Technology, and Maritime Culture, the Coordinating Ministry of Maritime and Resources Affairs, (Kompas)12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Translated from Kompas, Jumlah Wisatawan Bahari Didorong Tumbuh Jadi Dua Kali Lipat, 20 August 2015



"It is my hope that by planting the seeds in developing the Coral Triangle as a sustainable marine tourism destination, future generations 100 years from now will stand amongst the shores of the Coral Triangle, and be in awe of the legacy of a pristine coastal and marine environment that we will have left behind."

Ambassador Robert Blake, U.S. Embassy Jakarta, Indonesia (Jakarta Globe)<sup>13</sup>



 $<sup>^{13}</sup>$  Forum applauds conservation efforts: Jakarta Globe. Basten Gokken. 01 September, 2015

#### **Resource Notes:**

All of the forum presentations and session descriptions are available at:

http://www.ctibusinessforum.net/index.php/page/view/rbf-events/view/696/30/256/rbf-session.html, with PDF downloads available at:

http://www.ctibusinessforum.net/index.php/page/view/rbf-events/view/696/30/257/speakers-presentation.html

Independent full reports on each activity are available from lgallardo@coraltrianglecenter.org

Report published September 2015

Tuesday, September 1, 2015 Jakarta Globe

Indonesia News

5

Preserving Nature The 4th Coral Triangle Initiative on Coral Reefs, Fisheries, and Food was held in Ball from last Thursday through Saturday

# **Forum Applaud Conservation Efforts**

#### Basten Gokkon

A recent maritime-focused regional business forum among the Coral Triangle countries have granted international recognition to six entrepreneurs that have successfully integrated sustainable marine tourism practices in their operations.

The six were also lauded for their efforts to actively support the conversation of coastal areas, marine habitats and marine wildlife, and engage and support local communities in marine conservation activities.

The 4th Coral Triangle Initiative on Coral Reefs, Fisheries, and Food Security (CTI-CFF) Regional Business Forum, which was held in Nusa Dua, Bali, from last Thursday through Saturday, recognized six businesses from Indonesia, Malaysia, Papua New Guinea, the Philippines, Solomon Islands and Timor-Leste.

"Businesses in marine and coastal tour-

"Businesses in marine and coastal tourism in the Coral Triangle must receive adequat attention and commitment from all related stakeholders: governments, private sector, academia and communities. This can be in the form of support for infrastructure development, a road map for sustainable marine tourism and promotion and market access," said M. Eko Rudianto, director of Marine and Coastal for Indonesia's Ministry of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries, said in a statement obtained by The Jakarta Globe on Monday.

US Ambassador to Indonesia Robert Blake also commended the efforts of the private sector that have led the way in sustainable marine tourism across the

"I acknowledge the visionaries and leaders who have paved the way for sustainable marine tourism in the region and I hope more will follow your footsteps," the ambassador said in the statement. Blake underscored the importance of long-term vision in promoting sustainable marine tourism practices.
"It is my hope that by planting the seeds in developing the Coral Triangle as a sus-

"It is my hope that by planting the seeds in developing the Coral Triangle as a sustainable marine tourism destination, future generations 100 years from now, will stand amongst the shores of the Coral Triangle, and be in awe of the legacy of a pristine coastal and marine environment that we will have left behind."

Rill Djohani, executive director of the coral triangle center, said that the recognition profiles the important contributions entrepreneurs were making in reaching the goals of the Coral Triangle Initiative in ensuring that marine resources in the region are sustainably managed.

"Profiling the work of these businesses in this way will help underscore the im-

"Profiling the work of these businesses in this way will help underscore the importance for the Coral Triangle Initiative to act as a vehicle to promote equitable resource management and forging robust and resilient local communities centered around sustainable marine tourism," Rili said. The winners, which were chosen from 12 nominees submitted by various or-



This handout picture released by Conservation International shows glant Pacific manta swimming in the reef of Raja Ampat. AFP Photo/Sterling Zumbrun

ganizations across the Coral Triangle, are Ball's Reef Seen Divers' Resort; Malaysais's Scuba Junkie; PNG's Madang Resort Hotel; the Philippines' Evolution Diving; Oravae Cottage in Solomon Islands; and Dive Timor Lorosae in Timor-Leste.

The event was attended by more than 300 participants from over 20 countries, including high-ranking government officials, such as Malaysia's Minister of Tourism and Culture, Mohamed Nazri Abdul Aziz; the Solomon Islands' Minister of Tourism, Bartholomew Parapolo; and Honorary Adviser to Minister of Tourism in Indonesia, Indroyono Soesilo. The event was hosted by the Indonesia

The event was hosted by the Indonesia Coordinating Ministry of Maritime Affairs, the Ministry of Tourism and the Ministry of Marina Affairs and Fisheries, and co-organized by the CTI-CFF Regional Secretariat, US Agency for International Development, the US Department of the Interior, the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, the Coral Triangle Center, It also received the full support of the WWF, The Nature Conservancy, Administration, the Coral Triangle Center, and supported by WWF, The Nature Conservancy, Conservation International, Tone, XL Axiata and BNI.

### Sustainable Tourism Seen as Key to 'Coral Triangle' Conservation

Business and government leaders from six Asia-Pacific countries in the so-called Coral Triangle zone have called for the adoption of sustainable tourism guidelines and standards for development and investment in protected maritime zones.

The 4th Coral Triangle Initiative on Coral Reefs, Fisheries, and Food Security (CTI-CFF) Regional Forum gathered representatives from six pioneering countries – Indonesia, Malaysia, Papua New Guinea, the Philippines, Solomon Islands and Timor Leste – in Nusa Dua, Ball, from Thursday till Saturday.

In a policy round table at the forum, participants agreed that guidelines for sustainable tourism in the Coral Triangle could be largely built upon existing globally available guidelines, but with some tailored components specific to local conditions and revised to be made relevant to all potential tourism-related sectors. These guidelines include those established by

These guidelines include those established bi international organizations such as the Global Sustainable Tourism Council, according to a statement obtained by the Jakarta Globe on

Francis Lee, president of Singaporean resort Raffles Marina who was among the forum speakers, said that the adoption of standards for invest ments would not only boost efforts to conserve marine resources but also create shared values.

manne resources out also create shared values.

"Value creation, recognition, integration, management and realization, are imperative to sustainability, as they are to development," said Lee.

Businesses also urged the governments of the six nations involved to work with the private sec-

Businesses also urged the governments of this hations involved to work with the private sector and offer appropriate incentives – or remove disincentives – to encourage them to utilize sustainability standards.

"The private sector needs to understand that

The private sector needs to understand that no tourism is possible without sustainability, but when the government lacks resources, the private sector should stand hand in hand to protect the area, "Ismail Ning, chairman of the Indonesian Marine Tourism Association (Gahawisri), said in the statement.

The participants also endorsed a plan to cre-

ate a tourism branding and marketing mechanism for specific areas in the Coral Triangle that meets sustainable marine tourism standards. Such a mechanism should also reflect the values of the Coral Triangle countries and ensure a high quality visitor experience.

"We hope that the three-day forum will provide solid recommendations that allow more stakeholders to be more committed in practicing sustainable marine tourism at their respected countries, for the long run," said Widi Pratikto, executive director of the CTI-CFF regional secretariat.

The event was attended by more than 300 participants from over 20 countries, including high-ranking government officials such as the minister of tourism and culture from Malaysia Mohamed Nazri Abdul Azz, minister of tourism of Solomon Islands Bartholomew Parapolo and Indroyono Soesilo, the recently fired coordinating minister for maritime affairs who now serves as an bonorary adviser to Indonesia's minister of tourism. Basten Gokkon









www.ctibusinessforum.net